

## KIDNAPPED BOOKS IN PARIS: THE VATICAN VOLUMES IN THE BIBLIOTHÈQUE NATIONALE DE FRANCE

### ABSTRACT

The examination of a manuscript preserved in the archives of the Vatican Library (BAV Arch. Bibl. 53, pt. A, ff. 2-4), which contains a list of unreturned books, together with the printed catalogue of manuscripts and books confiscated by the French during the Napoleonic occupation (*Recensio manuscriptorum codicum* [Leipzig: impensis Paul Gotthelf Kummeri, 1803]), makes it possible to identify the printed volumes still held in the Bibliothèque Nationale de France. Most of these are valuable incunabula and *editiones principes*, and there are even items that have not previously been identified as part of the Napoleonic looting.

### KEYWORDS

Printed books, Vatican library, Napoleonic looting

The Vatican Apostolic Library (hereafter referred to as BAV) is home to an immense collection of manuscripts and printed works. Over the course of its more than five centuries, it has been enriched by important legacies, bequests, and transfers. Many popes and cardinals have been librarians and avid bibliophiles.<sup>1</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> It contains over 100,000 manuscripts and nearly two million printed books, including more than 8,600 incunabula. For the history of the BAV, see Jeanne Bignami-Odier and José Ruyschaert, *La Bibliothèque vaticane de Sixte IV à Pie XI. Recherches sur l'histoire des collections de manuscrits* (Città del Vaticano: Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, 1973) and the existing publications by Antonio Manfredi, *et alii*, ed., *Storia della Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana* (Città del Vaticano: Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, 2010-20), 5 vols., which cover its history from its earliest days to the last papal king of Rome, Pius IX (1792-1878). Two more histories are in the pipeline, covering the period from 1879 to the present day (see <[https://www.museivaticani.va/content/dam/museivaticani/pdf/eventi\\_novita/iniziative/eventi/2017/78\\_presentazione\\_collana\\_it.pdf](https://www.museivaticani.va/content/dam/museivaticani/pdf/eventi_novita/iniziative/eventi/2017/78_presentazione_collana_it.pdf)> [last accessed 23 December 2023]). My thanks are due to the staff of the BnF Rare Books Reserve (Room Y) for granting me unrestricted access to their volumes and for providing me with very useful information. I am also grateful to the BAV librarians, who went above and beyond their duties to respond to my requests.

However, on certain exceptional occasions, these collections have also been subject to depletion.<sup>2</sup> Besides the losses recorded in May 1527 during the famous Sack of Rome,<sup>3</sup> the transfer of manuscripts and books to the Bibliothèque nationale de France (BnF) as a result of Napoleon's looting is worthy of particular mention.<sup>4</sup>

---

<sup>2</sup> These depletions are not so significant in quantitative terms, especially in light of the vast number of manuscripts and books deposited at the BAV (on the same subject see Mark L. Sosower, Donald F. Jackson, and Antonio Manfredi, *Index seu inventarium Bibliothecae Vaticanae Divi Leonis Pontificis optimi. Anno 1518 c. Series graeca* [Città del Vaticano: Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, 2006], p. XII and Assunta Di Sante, 'La biblioteca rinascimentale attraverso i suoi inventari', in *Le origine della Biblioteca Vaticana tra Umanesimo e Rinascimento (1447-1534)*, ed. Antonio Manfredi [Città del Vaticano: Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, 2010], pp. 309-50, p. 343). However, the losses I am referring to are indeed out of the ordinary and in some ways important (for example, in the case of the printed volumes, we will discover that most of the books lost as a result of Napoleon's plundering were incunabula and *editiones principes*).

<sup>3</sup> On the dispersion of the BAV's printed volumes and manuscripts during this period, see Bignami-Odier and Ruyschaert, *La Bibliothèque*, pp. 30-1; Sosower, Jackson, and Manfredi, *Index*, pp. XII-XXII; Di Sante, 'La biblioteca rinascimentale', pp. 339-47; Giacomo Cardinali, *Inventari di manoscritti greci della Biblioteca Vaticana sotto il pontificato di Giulio II (1503-13)* (Città del Vaticano: Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, 2015), p. 352; and Teresa Martínez Manzano, 'Génesis y destino de dos manuscritos de Platón: de Bizancio al Escorial a través de la Biblioteca Vaticana', *Myrtia*, 36 (2021), pp. 158-82, p. 168.

<sup>4</sup> For a good overview of the scale of book and manuscript confiscation during this period, see Anthony Hobson, 'Appropriations from foreign libraries during the French Revolution and Empire', *Bulletin du bibliophile*, 2 (1989), 255-72. On the devastation caused by French troops, see Andreina Rita, 'Tra rivoluzione e restaurazione. La Vaticana di Marini, Battaglini e Baldi', in *La biblioteca vaticana dall'occupazione francese all'ultimo Papa Re (1797-1878)*, ed. Andreina Rita (Città del Vaticano: Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, 2020), pp. 55-105, p. 62: 'Danni e perdite furono molto rilevanti; la Biblioteca subì una vandalica devastazione: i soldati, attirati per avida

On 19 February 1797, the Treaty of Tolentino was signed between Napoleon Bonaparte (1769-1821), then still First Consul of France, and Pope Pius VI (born Count Giovanni Angelo Braschi [1717-99]).<sup>5</sup> Among many other concessions, the Papal States undertook to deliver works of art, books, and manuscripts to France.<sup>6</sup> No fewer than five hundred manuscripts and one hundred and thirty-six printed books left the shelves of the BAV destined for the BnF, as documented in the catalogue of confiscated manuscripts and books drawn up by order of Pope Pius VI. This catalogue was later printed in Leipzig in 1803 under the title *Recensio manuscriptorum codicum qui ex universa Bibliotheca Vaticana selecti iussu domini nostri Pii VI pont. m.* (Lipsiae: impensis Paul Gotthelf Kummeri, 1803) (hereafter referred to as R).<sup>7</sup> The consignment

---

bramosia dalle decorazioni in oro e argento, non esitarono a strapparle, rovinando documenti, libri e oggetti’.

<sup>5</sup> Its Article XIII confirms what had previously been affirmed in Article VIII of the Armistice of Bologna (23 June 1796): ‘Art. VIII: Le pape livrera à la république française cent tableaux, bustes, vases, ou statues, au choix des commissaires qui seront envoyés à Rome; parmi lesquels objets seront notamment compris le buste de bronze de Junius Brutus et celui en marbre de Marcus Brutus, tous les deux placés au capitole; et cinq cent manuscrits au choix des mêmes commissaires’ (see Christophe G. de Koch, *Histoire abrégée des traits de paix entre les puissances de l’ Europe* [Bruxelles, 1837], 1, 576; Marie-Louise Blumer, ‘Le transport en France des objets d’ art cédés par le traité de Tolentino’, *Revue des études italiennes*, 1 [1936], 11-23; and Clive Parry, ed., *The Consolidated Treaty Series*, 53 [1969], 128, and 489 [Treaty of Tolentino]).

<sup>6</sup> See Eugène Müntz, ‘La bibliothèque du Vatican pendant la Révolution française’, in *Mélanges Julien Havet* (Paris, 1895) pp. 578-91; Luigi Berra, ‘Opere d’arte asportate dai Francesi da Roma e dallo Stato Pontificio e restituite nel 1815 dopo il Congresso di Vienna’, *Rendiconti della Pontificia Accademia Romana di Archeologia*, 27 (1955), pp. 239-46; and Bignami-Odier and Ruyschaert, *La Bibliothèque*, pp. 185-90.

<sup>7</sup> A handwritten version is preserved in the manuscripts BAV Arch. Bibl. 55, ff. 1-43<sup>v</sup>, 100, ff. 1-62<sup>v</sup>, and BnF NAL 2354. For an abridged catalogue, which in the case of the BAV does not include printed volumes, see *Catalogo de’capi d’opera di pittura, scultura, antichità, libri, storia naturale, ed altre curiosità trasporteti dall’Italia in*

of books and manuscripts belonging to the BAV left Roma in nine crates in July 1797, arriving in Paris one year later, although the printed volumes departed from Roma later in May 1798 as part of a second confiscation.<sup>8</sup>

Although in the Congress of Vienna, held in 1814-15 after the fall of Napoleon, the restitution of the confiscated works of art was ordered, including manuscripts and books, not all were returned.<sup>9</sup> Research has already been carried out on the manuscripts that remained in the BnF,<sup>10</sup> but the same cannot be said of the printed volumes, despite the fact that they were often incunabula or rare editions of considerable value, some of them even unique.<sup>11</sup>

---

*France* (Venezia: Presso Antonio Curti Q. Giacomo, 1799) (selection of manuscripts on pp. 27-8). There is also a list of incunabula and rare books chosen by the archivist Pierre-Claude-François Daunou (1761-1840) to be taken to Paris after the treaty of Tolentino in Paris, BnF NAF 21910, ff. 274-283 (see Maria Pia Donato, *L'archivio del mondo. Quando Napoleone confiscò la storia* [Bari-Roma: Laterza, 2019], p. 130 n. 31).

<sup>8</sup> See Leopold Delisle, *Le Cabinet des manuscrits de la Bibliothèque nationale* (Paris: Imprimerie Impériale, 1868-81), 2, pp. 34-6, Marie-Pierre Laffite, 'La Bibliothèque nationale et les conquêtes artistiques de la Révolution et de l'Empire: les manuscrits d'Italie', *Bulletin du Bibliophile*, 2 (1989), pp. 272-323, p. 282, and Rita, 'Tra rivoluzione e restaurazione', pp. 57, and 61-62. For several handwritten catalogues of the confiscated material, see Rita, 'Tra rivoluzione e restaurazione', pp. 99-100 n. 60.

<sup>9</sup> See Marie-Pierre Laffite, 'Napoléon et les confiscations de livres dans les monastères italiens', in *How the Secularization of Religious Houses Transformed the Libraries of Europe, 16th-19th Centuries*, ed. Cristina Dondi, Dorit Raines, and Richard Sharpe (Turnhout: Brepols, 2020), pp. 223-44, p. 237.

<sup>10</sup> See Salvatore Lilla, *I manoscritti Vaticani Greci. Lineamenti di una storia del fondo* (Città del Vaticano: Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, 2004), pp. 87-89, Laffite, 'La Bibliothèque', pp. 272-323, and P. Vian, '«Per le cose della patria nostra». Lettere inedite di Luigi Angeloni e Marino Marini sul recupero dei manoscritti vaticani a Parigi (1816-1819)', *Miscellanea Bibliothecae Apostolicae Vaticanae* 18, (2011), pp. 693-700.

<sup>11</sup> The lack of such research has been recently been remarked upon by Laffite, 'Napoleon', p. 238: 'Pour ce qui concerne les livres imprimés, le catalogue des

According to the testimony of Antonio Panizzi (1797-1879), assistant librarian at the British Library, some of the books were deliberately withheld. During a visit to the BnF in January 1836, he was shown the volumes of the *editio princeps* of Eustathius' commentary on Homer, published in 1542-50, and noticed that the title page of one of the volumes bore a reference to its Vatican origin.<sup>12</sup> When he expressed his belief that all had been returned, the reply he received left no room for doubt: 'Oh no'... 'Non li abbiamo restituiti tutti, siamo stati ben attenti a non farlo'.<sup>13</sup>

---

incunables de la Bibliothèque nationale de France donne de nombreuses informations sur ce sujet, mais l'identification systématique des exemplaires reste encore un chantier à mener'. For a brief list of unreturned books see A. Popel Pozo, 'Napoleone e il suo bottino in Italia. I preziosi codici, manoscritti e libri deportati a Parigi', *La Biblioteca di Via Senato Milano*, 4 (2012), pp. 11-19, p. 19, Hobson, 'Appropriations', pp. 264 and 269, and Rita, 'Tra rivoluzione e restaurazione', p. 105 n. 274.

<sup>12</sup> Today, only the second volume (Vélins 542) still bears the old BAV shelfmark 'Vaticano 10649' in the upper margin of the title page (see *infra*). This page has been reproduced in Paul G. Weston, 'Un fortunato incontro e la storia di un edizione', in *La biblioteca vaticana*, p. 505.

<sup>13</sup> See the *Report from the Select Committee on the British Museum; together with the minutes of evidence, appendix, and index, ordered by the House of Commons to be printed* (London: The House of Commons, 1836), p. 4784 (quoted in Weston, 'Un fortunato incontro', p. 504). For Panizzi's role as British library delegate, see Paul G. Weston, "'I look with impatience for your return". Antonio Panizzi a zozzo per le biblioteche europee', in *Percorsi e luoghi della conoscenza. Dialogando con Giovanni Solimine su biblioteche, lettura e società*, ed. Giovanni Di Domenico, Giovanni Paoloni, and Alberto Petrucciani (Milano: Editrice Bibliografica, 2016), pp. 31-53 and 'Antonio Panizzi esule al servizio della comunità bibliotecaria', in *Tutti riceviamo un dono. Per festeggiare i dieci anni dell' Istituto di studi italiani di Lugano*, ed. Corrado Bologna, Stefano Prandi, and Fabio Pusterla (Bellinzona: Casagrande, 2018), pp. 168-76. For more on the BnF curators' intentions to retain the books and manuscripts see Hobson, 'Appropriations', p. 271.

In addition, the Vatican archivist Marino Marini (1783-1855), who was designed to be in charge of the transport of the archives back to Rome, admitted late that he was deluded by the French librarian Joseph-Basile-Bernard van Praet (1754-1837) in relation to the restitution of fifteenth century editions, affirming on him that he was a “uomo, che nella restituzione de’ libri stampati nel quattrocento, si dié a conoscere per così di poca buona fede, anzi per così grande ingannatore quanto altri mai possa esistere”.<sup>14</sup> Actually, there is a list of book returned to Marini and signed by van Praet, Arch. Bibl. 53, pt. A, ff. 43-44<sup>v</sup>, but it happens to be completely unreliable.<sup>15</sup>

A manuscript, BAV Arch. Bibl. 53, pt. A, ff. 2-3 (hereafter referred to as N), preserved in the archives of the BAV, contains a handwritten list of the printed books that were never returned to the BAV. It was drawn up by the canon, *scriptor*, and *custos* of the BAV, Angelo Battaglini (1759-1842), who goes so far as to quantify the amount of the loss.

This catalogue is conveniently entitled ‘*Nota dei libri stampati non restituiti, o restituiti imperfetti, o alterati alla Pontificia Biblioteca Vaticana tolti dal Governo Francese*’. It is a rather careless transcription, riddled with mistakes and misunderstandings. For example, by writing *Bernardi Justiniani orationes. De vita B. Laurentii* instead of *Bernardi Justiniani orationess in beati Laurentii... vitam*, one title is split into two, giving the impression of two works bound together in one volume. The correct reference is quoted in an old BAV alphabetical catalogue (see Vat. lat. 14741, f. 212<sup>v</sup>: ‘*Bernardi Justiniani iunioris Leonardi filii oratoris. De vita B. Laurentii...*’).<sup>16</sup> The

---

<sup>14</sup> See Marino Marini, *Memorie storiche dell’ occupazione e restituzione degli Archivi della S. Sede e del reacquisto de’ Codici e Museo numismatico del Vaticano, e de’ manoscritti, e parte del Museo di storia natural di Bologna*, in *Regestum Clementis papae V ex Vaticanis Archetypis, cura et studio Monachorum Ordinis S. Benedicti*, Romae 1885, 1, p. CCXLIV (quoted by Andreina Rita, ‘Tra rivoluzione e restaurazione’, p. 95), and Hobson, ‘Appropriations’, pp. 270-1.

<sup>15</sup> See Rita, ‘Tra rivoluzione e restaurazione’, p. 96.

<sup>16</sup> This is an alphabetical catalogue (*Codicum typis editorum Vaticanae Bibliothecae inventarium... sub Emanuele a Schelstrate primo eiusdem custode per Georgium abbat. Gripparium in eadem bibliotheca scriptorem* [7 vols.: Vat.lat. 14741–7]), based on the

same is likely to have occurred in the case of the supposed joint edition of Filelfo's *Epistles* and his translation of Basil's treatise *De vita solitaria* (see *infra*). There is also confusion as to the date of the edition of Origenes' work *Contra Celsum et in fidei christianae defensionem*, which is given as 1469 instead of the correct 1481. This error is probably attributable to the date of the previous title, Joannes de Spira's Venetian edition of Cicero's *Epistolae familiares* (1469). A similar misdating can be seen in the case of the incunabulum *Catulli epigrammata et Publii Papinii Statii Sylvae cum not. mss.*, which is incorrectly dated to 1471 instead of 1473, as documented in Gripari's catalogue (Vat.lat. 14742, f. 14), Arch. Bibl. 100, f. 60 and in R (p. 140).<sup>17</sup> On other occasions, the old Vatican shelfmark quoted in N is wrong. For example, the aforementioned Origenes' work is given the number '10252' when the correct number is in fact '1252'.<sup>18</sup> A further example is the misattribution of number '6601' to another previously mentioned work *Bernardi Justiniani orationes. De vita B. Laurentii (sic)* (Venetiis: labore et industria Iacobi de Rubeis, 1475), when it actually corresponds to another book in Gripari's catalogue.<sup>19</sup>

The list is divided into two sections on the basis of the provenance of the books, distinguishing between (A) books originating from the BAV and (B) books that

---

one prepared by the Vatican *scriptor* Giorgio Gripari before 1690 and better known as 'Prima raccolta': *Codicum typis...* [dated to 1686–90] [2 vols.; Vat. lat. 14748–9]. Where necessary, I have also consulted the earlier catalogue compiled by Andronico Spinelli in 1620, *Index librorum impressorum per ordinem alphabeticum digestum* (Vat. lat. 14476 and 14478). Most of these volumes are available online on the BAV webpage.

<sup>17</sup> At BAV Arch.Bibl. 53, pt. A, f. 43<sup>v</sup> is dated to 1472.

<sup>18</sup> See Vat.lat. 14748, f. 76<sup>v</sup>, Arch. Bibl. 100, f. 59<sup>v</sup>, and R, p. 139, Andreina Rita, 'La versione latina di Cristoforo Persona del *Contra Celsum* di Origine nell' esemplare della Vaticana di Sixto IV', *Miscellanea Bibliothecae Apostolicae Vaticanae*, 20 (2014), pp. 686-94, p. 690, and *infra*.

<sup>19</sup> See Vat. lat. 14749, f. 50<sup>v</sup>, and *infra*. The correct shelfmark, '3358', appears in Vat. lat. 14741, f. 212<sup>v</sup>, Arch. Bibl. 100, f. 59, and in R (p. 138).

once belonged to the library of the Marquis Alessandro Gregorio Capponi (1683-1746), the latter having been integrated into the BAV as an independent collection in 1746.<sup>20</sup>

The nature of the works that were not returned is varied, with a predominance of classical authors and works by authors of the first Italian Renaissance. Primarily consisting of incunabula, they also include editions from the first half of the 16th century. In all, as many as forty-one volumes are listed, counting the volumes or different copies of the same work that are mentioned as separate

---

<sup>20</sup> The *Biblioteca Capponiana*, made up of countless manuscripts and printed books by the most important Italian authors, was bequeathed to the BAV by the Marquis Alessandro Gregorio Capponi, officially becoming part of the BAV collection on 7 December 1746 (see Giuseppe Salvo Cozzo, *I codici Capponiani della Biblioteca Vaticana* [Roma: Tipografia Vaticana, 1897], p. XVIII n. 24 and Francesco D’Aiuto and Paolo Vian, *Guida ai fondi manoscritti, numismatici, a stampa della Biblioteca Vaticana*, ed. Francesco D’Aiuto and Paolo Vian [Città del Vaticano: Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, 2011], 1, pp. 397-400). See also the old catalogue *Catalogo della libreria Capponi o sia de’ libri italiani del fù Marchese Alessandro Gregorio Capponi, con ampie note critiche attribuite a mons. D. Giorni e al padre A. P. Berti* (Romae: Appresso il Bernabò, e Lazzarini, 1747); Maria Gabriella Critelli, ‘Acquisizioni di manoscritti latini nel secolo XVIII’, in *Storia della Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana. Vol. IV: La Biblioteca Vaticana e le arti nel secolo dei Lumi (1700-97)*, ed. Barbara Jatta (Città del Vaticano: Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, 2016), pp. 240-241, Massimo Ceresa and Raffaella Vincenti, ‘Gli stampati della Vaticana nel XVIII secolo’, in *Storia della Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana*, 4, pp. 352-8; and M. P. Donato, ‘Un collezionista nella Roma del primo Settecento: Alessandro Gregorio Capponi’, *Eutopia*, 2.1 (1993), pp. 91-102, and ‘Il vizio virtuoso collezionismo e mercato a Roma nella prime metà del settecento’, *Quaderni storici*, 115 (2004), pp. 139-60. On the BAV incunabula from this collection, see Laura Lalli, ‘Gli incunaboli del marchese Alessandro Gregorio Capponi’, in *Storia della Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana*, 4, pp. 354-7. According to the BAV online catalogue, we may also include the following items: Inc. III 234, 314, 323 (this is erroneously mentioned as Inc. II 323 by Ceresa - Vincenti, ‘Gli stampati della Vaticana’, p. 353); IV 106, 310, 316, and 374.

items. Eight of these, however –four of the five copies of Janus Lascaris’ *Anthologia veterum epigrammatum Graecorum* (Florentiae: per Laurentium Francisci de Alopa, 1494) and four of the five volumes of the Aldine edition of Aristotle’s *Opera omnia* (Venetiis: apud Aldum Manutium, 1495-98) (see *infra*)– did in fact return to the BAV. In addition, some were replaced by others with different subject matter or value, and others arrived in a poor state of repair.

For the purposes of this study, we will continue to categorise the confiscated books by provenance. Within each category, a distinction is then made between (I) books that were not returned, (II) books that were returned in poor condition, and (III) books that were replaced by copies of lesser value.

To round off the list, we add a list of unreturned books that were overlooked by the copyist of N and remain in the BnF to this day, as well as a number of BnF volumes whose Vatican provenance is uncertain but likely.<sup>21</sup>

A. BnF volumes originating from the BAV (Arch. Bibl. 53, pt. A, f. 2):

I. Books that were not returned:

1. *C. Plinii Secundi Naturalis historiae libri XXXVII* (Venetiis: per Joannem de Spira, 1469).<sup>22</sup> Today these are Vélins 493-4, the first volume of which bears the old

---

<sup>21</sup> Each title is accompanied by a footnote providing the relevant references in the most important catalogues of incunabula or first editions. However, the information on the BAV collections is only given the first time they are mentioned.

Vatican shelfmark '9959' (see BAV Arch. Bibl. 100, f. 60\*\*, Vat. lat. 14749, f. 293) in the upper margin of its f. 2. This is the *editio princeps* of this work. The BAV has a paper copy of this edition which entered the library in the 20th century (Stamp.Ross. 932).<sup>23</sup>

2. *D. Basilii Magni epistola ad Gregorium Nazianzenum de officiis vitae solitariae, e Graeco in Latinum versa a Francisco Philelfo* ([Venezia]: [imprimeur de Basilius, 'De officiis vitae solitariae'], 1471).<sup>24</sup> This is volume C-4549. The BnF online catalogue indicates that it was part of a joint volume bearing the old BAV shelfmark '4575'.<sup>25</sup> This is an extraordinarily rare incunabulum. The only other known copy is currently held in the British Library (IA. 24813).<sup>26</sup>

---

<sup>22</sup> ISTC ip00786000 / GW M34312 / CIBN P-457 / Bod-Inc P-358. This is available online at <https://gallica.bnf.fr/ark:/12148/bpt6k319273g/f9.item> (last accessed 1 July 2023). These volumes were mentioned by the Abbot Henri Grégoire (1750-1831) as an example of the increasing value of these first printed books as early as 1796: 'Un exemplaire de la première édition de Pline le naturaliste, Venise 1469 fut acheté, en 1769, par Lavalère, au prix de 750 liv. En 1784 le même exemplaire a été vendu 1700 liv.; et en 1786, un autre exemplaire moins beau a été vendu à un Anglais pour 3000 liv.' (see Henri J.-B. Grégoire, 'Rapport, présenté par Grégoire au nom du comité d'instruction publique, relatif à l'inventaire du matériel bibliographique appartenant à la nation, lors de la séance du 22 germinal an II (11 avril 1794)', *Archives Parlementaires de la Révolution Française*, 88 (1969), pp. 444-8, p. 447 n. 3 and Laffite, 'Napoléon', p. 230). For the relevance of this edition, see J.-L. Charlet, 'Une querelle au sein de la *Res publica litterarum*: La question de Pline l'Ancien de 1469 au milieu du XV<sup>e</sup> siècle', in *Acta Conventus Neo-Latini Cantabrigensis*, ed. Rh. Schnur (Arizona, 2003), p. 7-21.

<sup>23</sup> The Rossiani collection was created from the library of Giovanni Francesco de Rossi (1796-1854) and was deposited in the Vatican by the Jesuits in 1921. It consists of more than 1,200 manuscripts and 8,200 printed works, including 2,500 incunabula (see d'Aiuto and Vian, *Guida ai fondi*, pp. 863-6).

<sup>24</sup> ISTC ib00270950 / GW 3699 / CIBN B-174.

<sup>25</sup> See <https://catalogue.bnf.fr/ark:/12148/cb30063783s> (last accessed 1 July 2023). This copy has been foliated throughout by a humanist hand and begins with no. 158.

According to N, it was bound with an unidentified edition of Filelfo's epistles, which was later returned to the Vatican. However, as it appears in both R (*Philelphi Eptae Basilii de Vita Solitaria 1471. in oct.*) and N (*Philelphi Epistolae. Basilii de Vita Solitaria. 1472. in 8*), this seems more likely to be an error by the copyists, who construed the presence of the translator's name (*Philelphi*) and the term '*epistola*' in the title of the work as meaning that an edition of Filelfo's epistles preceded the Latin version of Basil's treatise. This reference is correctly given in Arch. Bibl. 100, f. 59<sup>v</sup>: '6731. *Philelphi, Basilii epistolae de vita solitaria. 1471. In 8<sup>o</sup>*<sup>27\*\*</sup>. Given the very different format of most editions of Filelfo's Epistles (2<sup>o</sup> or 4<sup>o</sup>) and this edition of his translation of Basil *De vita's* epistle (8<sup>o</sup>) it is difficult to see how they could have been published together as a joint edition.<sup>28</sup>

---

<sup>26</sup> For a critical edition of this translation, see Jeroen de Keyser, 'Solitari ma non soli. Traduzioni umanistiche della lettera *De vita solitaria* di Basilio di Cesarea', *Medioevo greco*, 9 (2009), pp. 53-83, pp. 77-83. For Filelfo's Latin translations, see Silvia Fiaschi, 'Filelfo e i 'diritti' del traduttore. L'auctoritas dell'interprete ed il problema delle attribuzioni', in *Tradurre dal greco in età umanistica. Metodi e strumenti. Atti del Seminario di studio (Firenze, Certosa del Galluzzo, 9 settembre 2005)*, ed. Mariarosa Cortesi (Firenze: SISMELE Edizioni del Galluzzo, 2007), pp. 79-138. For the rare reeditions of this translation, see Silvia Fiaschi, *Repertorio delle traduzioni umanistiche a stampa: secoli XV-XVI* (Firenze: SISMELE Edizioni del Galluzzo, 2008), pp. 354-5 and de Keyser, 'Solitari ma non soli', pp. 74-5 n. 43.

<sup>27</sup> At van Praet's list it appears as '21. *Philelphi epistola in 4<sup>o</sup>*' (see BAV Arch. Bibl. 53, pt. A, f. 43).

<sup>28</sup> There is, however, an exception in 8<sup>o</sup>: *Epistolarum Francisci Philelphi libri sedecim* ([Paris]: veneunt ab honestissimo bibliopola Dionysio Roce, [1513]). A copy is preserved in the BAV, Mai. XI G I 40, but it was added in the 19th century (the library of the Italian Cardinal and philologist Angelo Mai [ca. 1785-1854] was acquired by the BAV in 1855 at half price: see d' Aiuto and Vian, *Guida ai fondi*, pp. 828-30). On Angelo Mai's role in the BAV, see Bignami-Odier and Ruyschaert, *La Bibliothèque*, pp. 210-215 and Giacomo Cardinali, 'La Biblioteca Vaticana da Angelo Mai alla repubblica romana (1819-1849)', in Rita, *La Biblioteca Vaticana*, pp. 133-72). There is another copy in the

Perhaps a misreading by the author of N provides a clue to unravelling the mystery of the copy of Filelfo's epistles which, according to N, was returned to the BAV. The author mistakenly used the old BAV shelfmark '6601' instead of the correct '3358' (see BAV Arch. Bibl. 100, f. 59<sup>v\*\*</sup>, Vat. Lat. 14741, f. 212<sup>v</sup>) when referring to the copy of *In Beati Laurentii, patriarchae Venetiarum, vitam ad monachos Carthusienses prohoemium incipit by Bernardus Justinianus* (Venetiis: labore et industria Iacobi de Rubeis, 1478). This was just before the mention of Filelfo's volume. However, in Grippari's catalogue this shelfmark corresponds to a joint volume of *Joannis Francisci Pici Mirandulani Staurostichon, hoc est, Carmen de mysteriis dominicae crucis nuper in Germaniam delapsis, cum comment. Jacobi Spiegelii* (Tubingae: in aedibus Thomæ Anselmi Badensis, 1512)<sup>29</sup> and *Epistolae Francisci Philelfi* (In urbe Basiliensi: per Nicolaum Kessler, 1500).<sup>30</sup> It is possible that this volume was overlooked in both R (and its previous manuscript versions\*\*) and N, leaving only its old shelfmark in N as a hint of its inclusion in the transfer of books. We can infer that the returned volume of Filelfo's epistles is today BAV Inc. IV 412, a copy of the 1500 edition mentioned earlier.<sup>31</sup> This volume was bound together with an edition of Jakob Spiegel's commentary on Pico della Mirandola's poem, as recorded in a pencil note on the front of a parchment guard page: '*una cum Io. Francesco Pico, cum Iacobi [...]uegel Tubingae 1512*'. It is therefore conceivable that Inc. IV 412 was the volume of Filelfo's epistle that was returned to the BAV, while the unreturned copy of J. Spiegel's commentary on Pico della Mirandola's poem may today be BnF Rés. M-YC-256.<sup>32</sup>

---

BnF: Rés. Z-2189. On the numerous humanistic editions of Filelfo's epistles, see Jeroen de Keyser, *Francesco Filelfo, Collected letters. Epistolarum libri XLVIII* (Alexandria: Edizioni dell'Orso, 2015), 1, pp. 14-17.

<sup>29</sup> USTC 694630.

<sup>30</sup> ISTC ip00599400 / GW M32969 / CIBN P-317. See Vat. 14749, f. 50<sup>v</sup>-51 (here Filelfo's volume is erroneously dated to 1550).

<sup>31</sup> ISTC ip00599400 / GW M32969 / CIBN P-317 / Bod-inc P-268.

<sup>32</sup> There is no copy of this edition at the BAV. The BnF copy has been rebound in recent times (late 19th century). On J. Spiegel's commentary on Pico della Mirandola's poem, see Steven Rowan and Gerhild S. Williams, 'Jacob Spiegel on Gianfrancesco Pico and

3. *Nova compilatio decretalium Gregorii IX [cum glossa Bernardo Bottoni]* (Maguntiae: Peter Schöffler, 1473).<sup>33</sup> Today this is Vélins 371, as it bears old BAV shelfmarks on the upper margin of f. 1.<sup>34</sup> Two copies of this edition are held by the BAV, but both were added to the collection in the 20th century.<sup>35</sup>

4. *Ciceronis rhetorica* (Romae, 1475). This is probably a reference to a volume of *Rhetorica ad C. Herennium* ([Venetiis: Printer of Datus, 'Elegantiolae' (H 5969\*), ca. 1475]),<sup>36</sup> typically bound together with Marcus Tullius Cicero, *De inventione, sive Rhetorica vetus* ([Venice: Filippo di Pietro], 1475).<sup>37</sup> There are two copies in the BnF,

Reuchlin: Poetry, Scholarship and Politics in Germany in 1512', *Bibliothèque d'Humanisme et Renaissance*, 44 (1982), pp. 291-305.

<sup>33</sup> ISTC ig00447000 / GW 11451 / CIBN G-345 / Bod-inc G-232. This item is absent from van Praet's list (see BAV Arch. Bibl. 53, pt. A, f. 43).

<sup>34</sup> These are '2589' and, crossed out, '2187', and '6745'.

<sup>35</sup> They are Stamp.Barb. AAA IV 18 and Stamp.Ross. 1856. The Barberini Collection, sold to the Vatican in September 1902, was begun in the mid-17th century by Maffeo Barberini (1568-1644) (Pope Urban VIII) and his cardinal nephew Francesco Barberini (1597-1689) (see Cinzia Fortuzzi, 'La Biblioteca Barberina e il chirografi di Urbano VIII', *Nuovi annali della scuola speciale per archivisti e bibliotecari*, 18 [2004], pp. 141-57, and D'Aiuto and Vian, *Guida ai fondi*, 1, pp. 336-40).

<sup>36</sup> ISTC ic00677000 / GW 6717 / CIBN C-467.

<sup>37</sup> ISTC ic00645000 / GW 6734 / CIBN C-382. Both R and N assigned to this work as shelfmark '10603', which corresponds in Vat. lat. 14749, f. 342<sup>v</sup> to a joint edition of *Aeneae Sylvii Piccolominei Dialogus et tres Quintiliani declarationes Romae 1475 / Bernardi Justiniani oratio habita ad Sixtum IV. Imperfecta*), and actually a copy of *Aeneae Sylvii Piccolominei dialogi* (Romae: per magistrum Iohannem Schurener de Bopardia, 1475) (ISTC ip00669000) was sent to Paris, according to R and its manuscript predecessors, and was returned. It is probably Inc.III.159 (there is a copy at the BnF, H-Rés. 324 (2), but it comes from Pietro Antonio Crevenna's auction [see *Catalogue des livres de la bibliothèque de M. Pierre Antoine Bolongaro-Crevenna* [Amsterdam: chez D. J. Changuion and P. den Hengst, 1789], 3, p. 163]). Besides, at Arch. Bibl. 100, f. 60 it is

but this one may well be Rés. X-308, which features an unidentified coat of arms of Italian origin,<sup>38</sup> since the other, Vélins 1052, comes from the Augustinian monastery of St Saviour in Bologna (see verso of first guard leaf and f. 111<sup>v</sup>).<sup>39</sup> There is a copy of this joint edition in the BAV: Inc. III 347.

5. *Anthologia veterum epigrammatum Graecorum, a Ioanne Lascare Rhyndaceno edita* (Florentiae: per Laurentium Francisci de Alopa, 1494).<sup>40</sup> Five copies of this edition were sent to Paris (nos. 11400-4 and 11406 [see Vat. lat. 14749, ff. 390<sup>v</sup>-391]). However, the copy corresponding to number '11402' in Gripari's catalogue failed to make its way back.<sup>41</sup> In the catalogue it is described as follows: '11402

---

added that the mentioned volume of Cicero's *Rhetorica* was bound with an copy of *Aeneae Sylvii Piccolominei dialogi*.

<sup>38</sup> See CIBN C-382 (I, p. 538).

<sup>39</sup> On the fate of this monastic library during the Napoleonic occupation, see Luigi Frati, 'La Biblioteca dei canonici regolari di S. Salvatore in Bologna', *Rivista delle biblioteche e degli archivi* 2, 1889, pp. 1-6, pp. 3-5; Maria Cristina Bacchi and Laura Miani, 'Vicende del patrimonio librario bolognese: manoscritti e incunaboli della Biblioteca Universitaria di Bologna', in *Pio VI Braschi e Pio VII Chiaramonti. Due Pontefici cesenati nel bicentenario della Campagna d'Italia. Atti del convegno internazionale (maggio 1997)*, ed. Andrea Emiliani (Bologna: CLUEB, 1998), pp. 369-475; and Laffite, 'La bibliothèque', pp. 284-90. On the confiscation of manuscripts and printed volumes from Italian monasteries during the French occupation, see Andreina Rita, *Biblioteche e requisizioni libraire a Roma in età napoleonica. Cronologia e fonti romane* (Città del Vaticano: Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, 2012), pp. 93-354, 'Tra rivoluzione e confiscazione', pp. 62-64, and 75-76 and 'La Biblioteca Vaticana e la dispersione delle biblioteche dei religiosi romani nella prima Repubblica Romana e nell'età napoleonica', in *How the Secularization*, pp. 287-302; and Laffite, 'Napoléon', pp. 223-44.

<sup>40</sup> ISTC ia00765000 / GW 2048 / CIBN A-410 / Bod-inc A-308.

<sup>41</sup> According to Luigi Ferreri, 'Vaticana et Angelicana: note su esemplari di edizioni a stampa appartenenti alle biblioteche Vaticana e Angelica', *Miscellanea Bibliothecae Apostolicae Vaticanae*, 9 (2002), pp. 169-201, p. 178, and leaving aside no. 11402,

*Epigrammata Graeca, cum nott. marg. mss. et Io(an)nis Lascaris epistola ad Petrum Mediceum in fine. Florentiae. 1494. In 4<sup>o</sup>*. According to Luigi Ferreri, it corresponds to No. '2750' of Spinelli's catalogue (Vat. lat. 14478, f. 54): '2750. *Aliud [epigrammatarium graecum] cum annot. Andrea Alieriensis 4. Florent. ar. 19*' and to no. 45 in Fulvio Orsini's library: '45. *Epigrammatario greco, che fù di Andrea Aleriense, scholiato, in-4<sup>o</sup>, coperto di corame rosso*'.<sup>42</sup> It is possible that this is the present-day Vélins 1060, as it comes from the library of the canons regular of S. Pietro in Vincoli in Rome (with its stamp on f. Aii) and, according to Joseph van Praet's catalogue,<sup>43</sup> later belonged to Pope Pius VI. It is well known that his library was assembled from duplicates from the BAV and was seized by the French army in 1798 following the assassination of General Mathieu Léonard Duphot (1769-97).<sup>44</sup> It is attested that a

---

these are now Inc. III 81 ('11400'), 78 ('11401'), 77 ('11403'), 80 ('11404'), and 79 ('11406').

<sup>42</sup> See Pierre de Nolhac, *La bibliothèque de Fulvio Orsini. Contributions a l'histoire des collections d'Italie et a l'étude de la Renaissance* (Paris: F. Vieweg, 1887), p. 354, Ferreri, 'Vaticana et Angelicana', pp. 169-78, and Guillermo Galán Vioque, 'Fulvio Orsini y la Appendix Barberino-Vaticana', *Emerita*, 91 (2023), pp. 271-96, p. 275. For chronological reasons, this Andreas Aleriensis is not to be confused with Giovanni Andrea Bussi (1417–75), bishop of Aleria (see Ferreri, 'Vaticana et Angelicana', p. 172, and Galán Vioque, 'Fulvio Orsini', p. 275 n. 13).

<sup>43</sup> See Joseph B. B. van Praet, *Catalogue des livres imprimés sur vélin de la bibliothèque du roi* (Paris: chez de Bure Frères, 1822), 4, p. 63 (no. 80).

<sup>44</sup> See Hobson, 'Appropriations', p. 263. On Pius VI's personal library, see BAV Arch. Bibl. 32, 2 pt., ff. 1-62<sup>v</sup>; Müntz, 'La bibliothèque', pp. 583-4; Bignami-Odier and Ruyschaert, *La Bibliothèque*, pp. 194-5 n. 31; Luigi Michelini Tocci, 'Dei libri a stampa appartenuti al Colocci', in *Atti del Convegno di studi su Angelo Colocci. Jesi 13-14 settembre 1969*, ed. Vittorio Fanelli (Jesi: Amministrazione comunale di Jesi, 1972), pp. 77-97, p. 86; Ceresa and Vincenti, 'Gli stampati', pp. 390-1; and Hobson, 'Appropriations', p. 263, and Alessandra Mazzoccone and Paul G. Weston, 'La libreria degli stampati: accrescimento e organizzazione', in *La biblioteca vaticana*, pp. 501-528, p. 510.

vellum copy of Lascaris' edition, which was part of his collection, was sent to Paris.<sup>45</sup> As regards the marginal manuscript notes mentioned in the old catalogues, there are none in Vélins 1060, with the exception of the last quire. This is in fact taken from another volume and features handwritten corrections and additions to the text in the margins.<sup>46</sup>

6. *Aristotelis ethica, politica et oeconomica graecè* (Venetiis: per Aldum, 1498).<sup>47</sup> Today this is held in the BnF with shelfmark Rés. R-321. On both f. 1 and on the edge of the spine it bears the old Vatican shelfmark no. '8230' (cf. Vat. Lat. 14749, f. 164). The same spine also features the coats of arms of Pope Pius VI, partially obscured by the label, and of Cardinal Francesco Saverio de Zelada (1717-1801). On the verso of the front cover there is also a bookplate with both coats of arms. The BnF copy is the last of the five volumes of the edition of Aristotle's *opera omnia* published by Aldus Manutius between 1495 and 1498 that were sent to France, the others being

---

<sup>45</sup> See BAV Arch. Bibl. 32, f. 110; Cardinali, 'La lente dissolution', p. 483 (no. 21); and Hobson, 'Appropriations', p. 264. Pius VI's confiscated books were shipped to Paris around September 1799 (see. Laffite, 'La bibliothèque', pp. 282, and 309-13).

<sup>46</sup> As Nathalie Coilly, BnF Curator responsible for printed volumes from the 15th century, points me out *per litteras*, it is printed on vellum that is less white and more wrinkled than the rest of the item and its folia are shorter. For political reasons, this quire is missing from most copies of this incunabulum (see Thomas Winstanley, *Catalogue of the very selected and valuable library of William Roscoe* (Liverpool: Smith and Galway, Printers, 1816), pp. 98-9, n<sup>o</sup> 871; Jacques-Charles Brunet, *Manuel du libraire et de l'amateur de livres* (Bruxelles: Meline, cans et comp., 1839), 1, p. 88; Emile Legrand, *Bibliographie hellénique ou description raisonnée des ouvrages publiés par des Grecs aux XV<sup>e</sup> et XVI<sup>e</sup> siècles* (Paris: Libraire Garnier Frères, 1885), 1, pp. 30-8; *Catalogue of Books Printed in the XVth Century now in the British Library*, ed. Alfred W. Pollard, *et alii* (London: Trustees of the British Museum, 1930), 6, p. 666; James Hutton, *Greek Anthology in Italy to the Year 1800* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1935), p. 116; and Anna Meschini, *G. Lascaris. Epigrammi greci* (Padova: Liviana, 1976), pp. 113-14).

<sup>47</sup> ISTC ia00959000 / GW 2334 / CIBN A-504 / Bod-inc A-384.

BAV Inc. II 276, 277, 278, and 280.<sup>48</sup> Some of these still bear the old BAV shelfmarks: Inc. II 276 ('8229'), II 278 ('8233'), and II 280 ('8232'). \*\*The first part of the fourth volume of this set of Aldus' edition of Aristotle, Inc. II 279, which actually is an edition of Theophrastus' *On plants* and other works, having been catalogued by Grippari as no. 8630 (see Vat. Lat. 14749, f. 192<sup>v</sup>), was not transfer to Paris with the other volumes. As is the case with the Paris volume, it still bears the seals of Pius VI and Cardinal Librarian de Zelada on its binding, which was attested in the BAV between 1779 and 1801. The other volumes were rebound in the time of Pope Gregory XVI (1765-1846) and Cardinal Luigi Lambruschini (1776-1854) in a full leather binding with gold embossing created for the Vatican Library between 1834 and 1853.<sup>49</sup> Some of these volumes, included the BnF copy, belonged to Cardinal Giovanni Salviati's library (1490-1553) and were chosen by Pope Pius VI for his own private collection.<sup>50</sup> On the other hand, it is likely that the Paris volume is the one listed as no. 49 in Fulvio Orsini's catalogue ('49. *Aristotele le cose morale, tocco dal Carteromacho, ligato alla greca in corame lionato, d'Aldo*').<sup>51</sup> Meanwhile, Inc. II 276, 277, 278, and 280 may correspond to no. 10 ('10 *Aristotele tutte l'opere, di stampa d'Aldo, con emendationi nelle margini, tocche da Scipione Carteromacho et ligate in corame rosso, in 4 tomi.*'), Inc. II 279 to no. 11 ('11. *Theophrasto di stampa d'Aldo, emendato et tocco di mano del Carteromacho, ligato in*

---

<sup>48</sup> See R, p. 138: '8229. *Aristotelis opera edita Venetiis an. 1495 et 1497. Quinque voluminibus in fol.*', and Arch. Bibl. 100, f. 59: '8229 ad 8233 *'Aristotelis opera edita Venetiis annis 1495 et 1497. Quinque voluminibus in folio*'.

<sup>49</sup> See Francesca Schena, 'Gli incunaboli di Scipione Carteromaco nella Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana: un primo censimento', *Miscellanea Apostolica Vaticana* 21 [2015], pp. 403-24, p. 415.

<sup>50</sup> See BAV Arch. Bibl. 32, f. 118<sup>v</sup> and Giacomo Cardinali, 'La lente dissolution de la bibliothèque grecque du cardinal Salviati. Une affaire de soldats, gentilshommes, papes, bibliophiles et pirates', *Journal des savants*, 2 (2020), pp. 429-92, p. 482 (no. 13: '*Eadem [= Aristotelis Opera], typis Aldi Venetiis 1497, in fol. tomi 3. Si trova lo stesso al num. 8230, 31, 32 e 33*').

<sup>51</sup> The BnF volume was rebound in the time of Pope Pius VI and Cardinal de Zelada, as attested by the presence of their gold embossed seals on the spine.

*corame rosso*'), and Inc.\*\* II 281, which belonged to the humanist Pier Matteo Ercolani (d. 1545),<sup>52</sup> to no. 70 ('70 *Ethica d' Aristotele et Politica, emendata da Pier Mattheo Herculano, ligato in corame negro, d' Aldo, in foglio*').<sup>53</sup> As with the BAV volumes annotated by Scipione Forteguerra ('il Carteromaco') and other hands, Rés. R-321 features handwritten marginal notes in black and red ink. It is probably the duplicate volume referred to by the Italian humanist Angelo Colocci (1467–1549) in BAV Inc. II 281, f. α1: '*Habet tabul<am> Scipionis et est duplicatum hoc volume et tabula respondet*'.<sup>54</sup> The BnF copy also features '*Habet tabul<am> [...]*' in Colocci's handwriting on the upper margin of f. 1.<sup>55</sup>

---

<sup>52</sup> On this humanist, see David Muratore, *La biblioteca del cardinale Niccolò Ridolfi* (Alessandria: Edizioni dell'Orso, 2009), 1, pp. 73-4, and 216-7 n. 54. There is also a volume containing Ovid's *Metamorphoses* ([Venezia]: Lucantonni Florentini impensa, 1489) with his notes in the BAV (Inc. II 121), available online at <<https://digi.vatlib.it/view/Inc.II.121>> (last accessed 23 December 2023). Both volumes are mentioned –but not identified– by de Nolhac, *La bibliothèque*, pp. 176, 356, and 383 and Muratore, *La biblioteca*, 74.

<sup>53</sup> See de Nolhac, *La bibliothèque*, pp. 351 and 354, Schena, 'Gli incunaboli', pp. 416 and 432 (picture no. III) and Giacomo Cardinali, 'Il profeta e il monsignore: quarantasette nuovi manoscritti (e tredici nuovi stampati) di Angelo Colocci nella Vaticana e alla nazione di Parigi', in *Libri, scritture e testi greci. Giornata di studio in ricordo di mons. Paul Canart, organizzata dalla Biblioteca apostolica vaticana e dal Comitato vaticano di studi bizantini (Città del Vaticano, 21 settembre 2018): atti*, ed. Francesco D'Aiuto and Cesare Pasini (Città del Vaticano: Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, 2022), pp. 259-334, pp. 292-3.

<sup>54</sup> See Schena, 'Gli incunaboli', p. 416 (a reproduction at p. 432) and Cardinali, 'Il profeta e il monsignore', p. 293.

<sup>55</sup> On this wording as evidence of Colocci's ownership, see Michelini Tocci, 'Dei libri a stampa', pp. 92-3. According to Cardinali ('Il profeta', pp. 292-3 [no. 17-19]), Forteguerra's *tabulae*, based on some of these Aristotelian volumes, are today preserved in the BAV manuscripts gr. 964 ('*Theophrasti tabula*' [Inc. II 279]), 965-6 ('*tabula Aristotelis de animalibus*' [Inc. II 278]), and 967 ('*tabula ethicorum Aristotelis*'

7. *Eustathii archiepiscopi Thessalonicae, in Homeri Iliadis et Odysseae libros parekbolai* (Romae: apud Antonium Bladum, impressorem Cameralem, 1542-50), 4 vols.<sup>56</sup> These are Vélins 541-4. In the upper margin of the title page of the second volume, Vélins 542, one can still read 'Vatic. 10649', which corresponds to the shelfmark of this volume in Gripari's catalogue (see Vat. lat. 14749, f. 345<sup>v</sup>; see also Arch.Bibl. 100, f. 60\*\*).<sup>57</sup>

## II. Books that were returned in poor condition:

1. *Catulli Epigrammata et Statii Sylvae* (Parmae: per Stephanum Corallum Lugdunensem, 1473).<sup>58</sup> According to N, this copy was returned in such poor condition, with almost nothing of the section corresponding to Catullus, that it cannot be considered anything other than a fragment. There is no copy of this edition in the BAV.

---

[Inc. II 281, although we now know that Bnf Rés. R-321 also belonged to Colocci]). All these manuscripts were once in Colocci's possession (see Samy Lattès, 'Recherches sur la bibliothèque d' Angelo Colocci', *Mélanges de l'école française de Rome*, 48 (1931), pp. 308-44, pp. 321-2 no. 2, 7, and 11). On Colocci's library, see Michelini Tocci, 'Dei libri a stampa', pp. 77-97; Corrado Bologna, 'La biblioteca di Angelo Colocci', in *Angelo Colocci e gli studi romanzi*, ed. Corrado Bologna and Marco Bernardi (Città del Vaticano: Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, 2008), pp. 1-20; and Marco Bernardi, 'Per la ricostruzione della biblioteca colocciana: lo stato dei lavori', in *Angelo Colocci*, pp. 21-84, reproduced at 'Angelo Colocci', in *Autografi dei letterati italiani. Il Cinquecento*, ed. Matteo Motolese, Paolo Procaccioli, and Emilio Russo (Roma: Salerno Editrice, 2013), 2, pp. 75-110.

<sup>56</sup> USTC 828521/ CNCE 18394.

<sup>57</sup> See Weston, 'Un fortunato incontro', p. 505. The old BAV shelfmark is not attested in the other volumes. As early as July 1822, Angelo Mai had lamented the loss of these copies (see BAV Arch. Bibl. 106, f. 146<sup>r-v</sup>: 'ricorda [...] quell' esemplare ora unico in pergamena dell'Eustazio che sta in casa Naro [= Palazzo Patrizi], opportuno a supplire il danno della Vaticana, che ha perduto il simile in Parigi' (quoted by Cardinali, 'La biblioteca vaticana', 5, p. 144).

<sup>58</sup> ISTC ic00321000 / GW 6386 / CIBN C-182 / Bod-inc C-138.

However, there is a complete copy in the BnF, RES M-YC-90, which originates from the Benedictine abbey of San Benedetto in Polirone.<sup>59</sup>

III. Books for which a substitute volume was returned:

1. *M. T. Ciceronis Epistolae ad familiares* (Venetiis: per Joannem de Spira, 1469).<sup>60</sup> This is Vélins 652, which bears the old BAV shelfmark '10057' in the lower margin of f. 1 (see Vat. Lat. 14879, f. 297<sup>v</sup>) and is a copy of the first edition. A second edition was printed just four months later. In N, it is mentioned that the BAV copy sent was on parchment whereas the copy that was returned was on paper. The BAV has a paper copy of the first edition, Inc. III 482, but it is heavily mutilated (only ff. 17-8 remain).<sup>61</sup> There is another paper copy of the second edition, Inc. II 2.<sup>62</sup>

2. *Publii Virgilio Maronis Opera* (Roma: Konrad Sweynheym et Arnold Pannartz, [1471]).<sup>63</sup> A copy containing handwritten notes by Angelo Poliziano (1454-94) is currently held in the BnF with shelfmark Rés. G-YC-236.<sup>64</sup> The old BAV shelfmarks

---

<sup>59</sup> Its stamp is on f. 1. The volumes sent to Paris from this library were never reclaimed. See Laffite, 'La bibliothèque', pp. 300-2 and 315 (she is concerned only with the manuscripts).

<sup>60</sup> ISTC ic00504000 / GW 6800 / CIBN C-340 / Bod-inc C-256.

<sup>61</sup> See William J. Sheehan, *Bibliothecae apostolicae Vaticanae incunabula* (Città del Vaticano: Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, 1997), 1, p. 371 (C-250).

<sup>62</sup> See Sheehan, *Bibliothecae Apostolicae Vaticanae*, 1, p. 371 (C-251). This copy is available online at <https://digi.vatlib.it/view/Inc.II.2> (last accessed 23 December 2023).

<sup>63</sup> ISTC iv00151400 / GW M49939 / CIBN V-105. At Arch. Vat. 100, f. 60, 53, pt A, f. 43<sup>v</sup> and R it is dated to 1473.

<sup>64</sup> This copy bears his ex libris on the recto of the second guard leaf: 'Angeli Politiani et amicorum / ἀγγέλου τοῦ πωλιτιανοῦ κτῆμα καὶ τῶν φίλων' (see also ff. 5<sup>v</sup> and 19). See also what is noted by Fulvio Orsini in the same folium: '*Virgilio con scholii Greci e Latini di mano del Politiano. / Ful. Urs*'. See J. M. S. Cotton, 'Ex libris Politiani', *The Modern Language Review*, 32 (1937), pp. 326-30, p. 329; Ida Maier, *Les manuscrites d'Angelo Politien. Catalogue descriptif. Avec dix-neuf documents inédits en appendice* (Genève: Librairie Droz, 1965), p. 353; and Livia Castano Musicò, *Angelo Poliziano. Commento*

'10885' (see Arch. Vat. 100, f. 60, Vat. lat. 14749, f. 357) and '2466' are attested on f. 1. Originally part of Fulvio Orsini's library<sup>65</sup>, this is a rare edition, with only six other surviving copies (in the libraries of Florence, Lucca, Manchester, Millau, Glasgow, and Vienna). We know that Poliziano collated the so-called 'Roman Vergil' (ms. Vat. lat. 3867), which was confiscated by the French troops and remained in Paris until 1816.<sup>66</sup> This edition of Vergil, annotated by Poliziano himself, also made its way to Paris. However, it met a different fate and remains in the BnF to this day. A copy of *Publii Virgilio Maronis Opera* (Venetiis: per Nicolaum Ienson Gallicum, 1475), of which there are thirty known copies, was sent in its place.<sup>67</sup> Two copies can be found in the BAV. The returned copy may be Inc. III 154 because the other, Stamp. Ross. 1126, was added at a later date.<sup>68</sup>

---

*inedito alle Georgiche di Virgilio* (Firenze: Olschki, 1990), pp. VII-VIII, and Lorenzo Vespoli, *Angelo Poliziano, Commento inedito alle Bucoliche di Virgilio* (Firenze: Leo S. Olschki, 2024). See also Massimo Gioseffi, *Studi sul commento a Virgilio dello Pseudo Probo* (Firenze: La Nuova Italia, 1991), pp. 286-8 and 'Angelo Poliziano e le postille pseudo-probiane a Virgilio', *Rendiconti dell'Istituto Lombardo*, 126, 1-2 (1992), pp. 65-86; Renata Fabbri, 'Virgilius, Poliziano e gli altri', *Atti dell'Istituto veneto di scienze, lettere ed arti. Classe di scienze morali, lettere ed arti*, 157, 3-4 (1998-9), pp. 689-704; and Carmen Paolino, 'Le *recollectae* del corso di Poliziano sulle *Georgiche*', in *Cultura e filologia di Angelo Poliziano: traduzioni e commenti. Atti del Convegno di studi (Firenze, 27-9 novembre 2014)*, ed. Paolo Viti (Firenze: Olschki, 2016), pp. 177-86.

<sup>65</sup> See de Nolhac, *La bibliothèque*, pp. 210-12, 381 no. 1: 'Virgilio, con scholii greci et latini di mano del Politiano, coperto di corame rosso'.

<sup>66</sup> See Remigio Sabbadini, *Scoperte dei codici latini e greci ne' secoli 14 e 15* (Firenze: G. C. Sansoni, 1905), p. 154; Pedro Martín Baños, 'De Virgilius a Vergilius. Poliziano y la bibliografía de Antonio de Nebrija', *RFE*, 87 (2007), pp. 79-83; and Leighton D. Reynolds and Nigel G. Wilson, *D'Homère à Érasme: La transmission des classiques grecs et latins* (Paris: CNRS Éditions, 2021 [reed.]), p. 116.

<sup>67</sup> ISTC iv00158000 / GW M49757 / CIBN V-117 (A), V-119 (B).

<sup>68</sup> Inc. III 154 is available online at <<https://digi.vatlib.it/view/Inc.III.154>> (last accessed 20 January 2024).

3. *Decretum Gratiani, cum apparatu Bartholomaei Brixiensis* (Maguntiae: Peter Schöffer, 1472).<sup>69</sup> These copies are Vélins 364-5, the first volume of which bears the old BAV shelfmarks '2588' and '6744' (crossed out) in the upper margin of f. 1. According to N, a paper copy was returned, the first pages of which were badly mutilated. The only paper copy preserved in the BAV is Inc. S 169. This is a mutilated copy, missing the initial quires and beginning with quire E.<sup>70</sup>

4. *Bernardi Justiniani oratoris in beati Laurentii, patriarchae Venetiarum, vitam ad monachos Carthusienses* (Venetiis: labore et industria Iacobi de Rubeis, 1475).<sup>71</sup> This is Vélins 2739, which bears the old BAV shelfmark '3358' in the lower margin of f. 1 (see Vat. Lat. 14741, f. 212<sup>v</sup>). This mark is also engraved in gold on the spine of the book, with the coats of arms of Pope Pius VI (front cover) and Cardinal de Zelada (back cover) on the binding.<sup>72</sup> According to N, a paper copy was returned, which could be the current Inc. IV 218.<sup>73</sup>

5. *Publii Virgilii Maronis opera* (Vicentiae: J. de Vienna, 1476).<sup>74</sup> This is Rés. G-YC-254, which has shelfmark '10887' on its f. 1 (see Arch. Vat. 100, f. 60, Vat. lat.

---

<sup>69</sup> ISTC ig00362000 / GW 11353 / CIBN G-283.

<sup>70</sup> In a complete copy the quires are as follows: [a<sup>8</sup> b-d<sup>10</sup> e<sup>8</sup> f g<sup>10</sup> h<sup>6</sup> i<sup>5</sup> k<sup>8+1</sup> l<sup>8</sup> m<sup>6</sup> n<sup>8+1</sup> o<sup>10</sup> p q<sup>8</sup> r<sup>6</sup> s<sup>4</sup> t u-z A<sup>10</sup> B C<sup>8</sup> D E<sup>10</sup> F<sup>8</sup> G<sup>9</sup> H I<sup>10</sup> K<sup>11</sup> L M<sup>10</sup> N<sup>8</sup> O<sup>6</sup> P<sup>8</sup> Q<sup>6</sup> R<sup>8</sup> S<sup>6</sup> T-X<sup>10</sup> Y<sup>8</sup> Z<sup>6</sup> aa bb<sup>8</sup>] (see Bod-Inc online on G-180 at <<http://incunables.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/record/G-180>> [last accessed 20 January 2024]). The other three copies are printed on vellum and entered the collection at a later date (Inc.Chig. S 439, Stamp.Ross. 1197-1198, and Stamp. Ross. 1197-1198bis).

<sup>71</sup> ISTC ij00611500 / GW M15546 / CIBN J-331. On the confusion surrounding this reference in N, see above.

<sup>72</sup> The old shelfmark '3298' is also written on the upper margin of f.1.

<sup>73</sup> According to the BAV online catalogue, there is an old shelfmark (no. 1303) on the front flyleaf and on the reverse of the first flyleaf. There is another copy in the BAV, but it was added a later date (Stamp.Ross. 1896).

<sup>74</sup> ISTC iv00160000 / GW M49762 / CIBN V-120. This volume is available online at <<https://gallica.bnf.fr/ark:/12148/bpt6k70524s>> (last accessed 1 July 2023).

14749, f. 357)<sup>75</sup> and fragments of Pius VI's coat of arms on the back cover. Only nine copies of this edition are attested, none of which are in the BAV. According to N, in its place a parchment copy of the edition *Publii Virgilii Maronis opera* ([Venetiis]: Hec Vindelinius scripsit apud Venetos, 1470) was sent to the BAV.<sup>76</sup> However, this copy is now missing, since the two attested copies belong to the Rossiani collection: a parchment copy, Stamp.Ross. 735, containing only the first thirty-five folia (up to *Georg.* 4.394), some in a very deteriorated condition,<sup>77</sup> and Stamp.Ross. 2317, printed on paper and containing only a few folia (ff. 33, 35-40). There are two copies in the BnF, one on parchment, Vélins 550, and the other on paper, Rés G-YC-237. A total of twenty-three copies survive, only ten of which are on parchment.

6. *Comento di Christophoro Landini fiorentino sopra la Comedia di Danthe Alighieri poeta fiorentino* (Florentiae: per Nicholo Di Lorenzo della Magna, 1481).<sup>78</sup> This is Rés. Yd-16, with 'Vaticano' written in the lower right corner of the verso of the front cover and the old BAV shelfmark '11512' on f. i. (see Arch. Vat. 100, f. 59, Vat. Lat. 14749, f. 460<sup>v</sup>).<sup>79</sup> According to N, a copy originating from a library in Genoa was returned. There are four copies in the Vatican, none of which are from Genoa.<sup>80</sup>

---

<sup>75</sup> The old shelfmark '2471' can also be found on f. 1.

<sup>76</sup> ISTC iv00150000 / GW M49733 / CIBN V-103.

<sup>77</sup> This copy is available online at <<https://digi.vatlib.it/view/Stamp.Ross.735>> (last accessed 23 December 2023).

<sup>78</sup> ISTC id00029000 / GW 7966 / CIBN D-13.

<sup>79</sup> On the verso of the cover, in the lower right-hand corner, 'Vaticano' is written in what appears to be an 18th-century hand. In addition, the BnF shelfmark has been written anonymously in pencil in the margin of Grippari's catalogue (see Vat. lat. 14749, f. 460<sup>v</sup>).

<sup>80</sup> The volumes in question are Inc. II 264, Inc. S 153, Inc.Chig. S 111, and Stamp.Ross. 1491. However, the latter two should be disregarded, since the Chigi family library, dating from the time of Pope Alexander VII (Fabio Chigi [1599-1667]), was donated to the BAV in 1923 (see D'Aiuto and Vian, *Guida ai fondi*, 1, pp. 403-9), and Inc. S. 153 comes from Capponi's library (see his stamp at ff. 2, and L10<sup>v</sup>). According to Laura Lalli, BAV librarian, *per litteras*, there are only two incunabula from Genoa, Inc. II 711

7. *Origenis Contra Celsum et in fidei christianae defensionem libri, interprete Christophoro Persona* (Romae: Georg Herolt, 1481).<sup>81</sup> This is Vélins 280, which bears the old shelfmark '1252' on f. 1 (see Arch. Bibl. 100, f. 59<sup>v\*\*</sup>, Vat. lat. 14748, f. 76<sup>v</sup>) and the coat of arms of Pope Sixtus IV in the lower margin of f. 3.<sup>82</sup> According to N, one paper copy was returned. Of the four copies in the BAV (Inc.Chig. III 29, Inc. III 268, III 526, and Stamp.Ross. 2092), this could be Inc. III 268, although in former times it belonged to an undetermined Jesuit monastery.<sup>83</sup>

---

(Genoa University Library; f. \*i: '*Congre. Missio. Urbanae S. Caroli Genoae*' [= Missionari Urbani di San Carlo Borromeo, Genoa] and Inc. II 210 (Benedictine monastery of San Siro at Genoa; f. Aii: '*Clerico[rum] Regular[ium] Domus S. Syri*' [= Monastero di San Siro, Genoa])).

<sup>81</sup> ISTC io00095000 / GW M28390 / CIBN O-57. On this copy, see van Praet, *Catalogue des livres*, 6, pp. 38-9, n. 364bis and CIBN, II, 2, p. 340, O-57. See also 1789. *Le patrimoine libéré: 200 trésors entrés à la Bibliothèque nationale de 1789 à 1799*, ed. Marie-Pierre Laffite and Odile Gantier (Paris: Bibliothèque Nationale, 1989), pp. 266-7; Rita, 'La versione latina', pp. 686-94 and her 'Tra rivoluzioe e restaurazione', p. 105 n. 274.

<sup>82</sup> See Rita, 'La versione latina', p. 690.

<sup>83</sup> See f. [I]5<sup>v</sup>: 'Collegij Societatis Iesu Monasterij 1588'. Inc. III 526 comes from the monastery of Santa Giustina in Padova (see f. [I]5<sup>v</sup>), where there was another copy of this edition, today at the library of the Braidense National Library in Milano (shelfmark AK.10.26; see f. [a]3r: '*Est Monachorum S. Justinae ipsius monasterio assignatus sub numero 2065*', and Giovanna Cantoni Alzati, *La Biblioteca di S. Giustina di Padova: libri e cultura presso I benedettini padovani in età umanistica* [Padova: Editore Antenore, 1982, p. 240]), and from a Camaldolese monastery (it bears its old shelfmark on the verso of the guard page ['Cod. 65']). Probably the Vatican copy was not at Santa Giustina when the first inventory was drawn up (second half of the 15<sup>th</sup> century; see Cantoni Alzati, *La Biblioteca*, p. 156). For the Camaldolese incunabula in the BAV, see Marco Buonocore, 'Fonti per la storia camaldolese nella Biblioteca Vaticana. Avvio ad un censimento', in Livia Martinoli and Ugo Fossa, eds., *Le fonti per la storia*

8. *Bernardi de Breydenbach Itinerarium et descriptio Terrae sanctae cum figuris in pergameno* (Maguntiae: [Peter Schöffer pour] Erhard Reuwich, 1486).<sup>84</sup> This is the incunabulum Vélins 769, which bears the old BAV shelfmark '6602' on f. 1 and again in gold lettering on the spine (see Arch. Vat. 100, f. 59\*\*, Vat. lat. 14749, f. 51).<sup>85</sup> It is bound with the coats of arms of Pius VI and Cardinal de Zelada on the spine. It is the *editio princeps* of this work and there is no copy in the BAV. According to N, the returned copy was the Dutch 1488 edition, Bernhard von Breydenbach, *Die heylighe beuarden tot dat heylighe graft in Jherusalem \*\**(Mainz: [Peter Schöffer pour] Erhard Reuwich, [1488]), also not in the BAV.<sup>86</sup> Despite the transfer, three copies remain in the BnF: Rés. Fol. O2f. 20, Fol. O2f. 20α,<sup>87</sup> and Fol. O2f. 20β.

B. Volumes originating from the library of Marquis Alessandro Gregorio Capponi (Arch. Bibl. 53 pt. A, f. 2<sup>v</sup>, and 44; 100, ff. 60-61\*\*).

I. Unreturned books:

1. *Joannis Bocacii Decameron* (Mantuae: Petrus Adam de Michaelibus, 1472).<sup>88</sup> This is Rés Y<sup>2</sup>-397, since it bears the stamp of the Capponi family library on f. 1 of the index and on f. 256<sup>v</sup>.<sup>89</sup> Only four copies of this edition survive (in addition to the

---

*camaldolese nelle Biblioteche Italiane e nella Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana* (Roma: Biblioteca nazionale centrale di Roma, 2015), pp. 41-61, pp. 50-52.

<sup>84</sup> ISTC ib01189000 / GW 5075 / CIBN B-771.

<sup>85</sup> It also bears the old shelfmarks '7633' and '3409', which have been crossed out.

<sup>86</sup> ISTC ib01191000 / GW 5081 / CIBN B-776.

<sup>87</sup> This copy is available online at <https://gallica.bnf.fr/ark:/12148/bpt6k9925864/f4.item> (last accessed 1 December 2023).

<sup>88</sup> ISTC ib00725400 / GW 4442 / CIBN B-524. In N it is mistakenly dated to 1473.

<sup>89</sup> This copy belonged to the Greek copyist Nikolaos Tourrianos (ca. 1535-1610), as it also bears his coat of arms and ex libris (see verso of the guard leaf and f. i). On this copyist, see Gregorio de Andrés, *El Cretense Nicolás de la Torre copista griego de Felipe II*, Madrid 1969 and José M. Floristán, 'El enigmático destino de Nicolás de la Torre, copista griego de Felipe II', in *Humanismo y pervivencia de mundo clásico*, ed. José M.

one in Paris, they are to be found in Nürnberg Stadtbibliothek [Inc. 97.2<sup>o</sup>], the British Library (London) [IB. 30605], and The John Rylands Library (Manchester) [Inc. 8658].

2. *Historia di Altobello e di Re Troiano suo fratello* (Vinegia: [Nel Beretin Convento della Ca Grande], 1476).<sup>90</sup> This is Rés. YD-90, featuring the stamp of the Marquis Alessandro Gregorio Capponi on f. aii. It is the *editio princeps* and the only surviving copy of this edition.

3. Publius Ovidius Naso, *De Arte amandi, in terza rima* (Mediolani: Leonhard Pachel et Ulrich Scinczenzeler, 1481).<sup>91</sup> This may be Rés. M-YC-236, which is also the only copy of this edition. According to R, this copy was dispatched from the BAV in a bound volume between a copy of *La vita di Merlino* (Venezia: Venturino Roffinelli ad instantia di Andrea Pegolotto, 1539) at the beginning<sup>92</sup> and an unidentified copy of *Vita di Alessandro Magno* at the end. *La vita di Merlino* must have been returned, because it is not mentioned in N and there is no copy in the BnF. The BAV has a copy in the Marquis Alessandro Gregorio Capponi collection (Stamp.Cappon. VI 146 [int.1]). As

---

Maestre, *et al.* (Teruel: Diputación Provincial de Teruel - Instituto de Estudios Turolenses - Servicio de Publicaciones de la Universidad de Cádiz, 2015), 4, pp. 2153-72.

<sup>90</sup> ISTC ia00544250 / GW 1582 / CIBN A-286. It is available online at <<https://gallica.bnf.fr/ark:/12148/bpt6k134630w/f2.item>> (last accessed 23 December 2023). See Ruedi Ankli, 'Il più antico poema cavalleresco a stampa nel suo contesto culturale: l' «Altobello» del 1476', *Rassegna europea di letteratura italiana*, 5 (1997), pp. 647-69. There is a manuscript note referring to this volume in a copy of *Historia di Altobello e di Re Troiano suo fratello* (Vicenza: Simon Bevilaqua, de Gabis, 1491) which is preserved in the Bodleian library with shelfmark Auct. 2Q 6.13b (inc. A-226). In the note it is said that there is a copy of the 1476 edition in the BAV. The Bodleian online catalogue adds that this copy, which is in fact in the BnF, 'is not recorded in GW, and is not now recorded by William J. Sheehan, *Bibliothecae apostolicae Vaticanae incunabula*, 4 vols (Città del Vaticano: Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, 1997)' (see <<http://incunables.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/record/A-226>> (last accessed 23 December 2023)).

<sup>91</sup> ISTC io00139300 / GW M28656 / CIBN O-92.

<sup>92</sup> USTC 800796 / CNCE 59791.

for the forementioned *Vita di Alessandro Magno*, this volume may be *Historia Alexandri Magni* (In Venezia: [Nel Beretin Convento della Ca Grande], 1477), which, according to Arch\*\*. Bibl. 100, f. 60 and R., p. 142, was sent to Paris and returned back (this might be \*\*BAV Inc. IV 219).<sup>93</sup>

4. Publius Virgilius Maro, *Bucolica, tradotta da Bernardo Pulci* (Firenze\*\*: Antonio Di Bartolommeo Miscomini, 1481).<sup>94</sup> This is the volume Rés. M-YC-460 (1), bearing the stamp of the library of the Marquis Alessandro Gregorio Capponi on f. a i.<sup>95</sup> There is another copy in the BAV which also belonged to the Capponi family library, Inc. IV 195 (f.\*\* biii<sup>v</sup> features the family stamp in black ink: 'Ex Bibliotheca A. G. Capponii Romæ', as well as the handwritten initials 'A.G.C.' [Alessandro Gregorio Capponi]).<sup>96</sup>

5. *Libro chiamato Ambitione... nel quale si dichiarano e precepti della agricultura secondo la Georgica di Virgilio, tradotte da Bastiano Foresi* ([Firenze: Antonio Miscomini, ca. 1485]).<sup>97</sup> This is Rés. M-YC-460 (2), which is bound together with the previous volume. A copy is kept in the BAV, but it was added later (Stamp.Ross. 793).

6. *Bucoliche elegantissimamente composte da Bernardo Pulci,... et da Francesco de Arsochi,... et da Hieronymo Benivieni,... et da Jacopo Fiorino de*

---

<sup>93</sup> ISTC ia00409500 / GW 881 / CIBN H-149. There is also a copy in the Bnf, Rés. J-1485, which, according to a pencil note on the verso of the first guard leaf, was acquired at the 1792 Paris auction of Cardinal Étienne Charles de Loménie de Brienne's library (see *Index librorum ab inventa typographia ad annum 1500* [Senonis: apud viduam et filium P. Harduini Tarbé 1791], 1, p. 408 [no. 1]).

<sup>94</sup> ISTC iv00216000 / GW M50067 / CIBN V-153.

<sup>95</sup> There is another copy at the BnF, Rés. M-YC-459, which was acquired at the auction of Cardinal Étienne Charles de Loménie de Brienne's library (see *Index librorum*, 2, pp. 52-3 [no. 32]).

<sup>96</sup> The BAV owns one more copy, Stamp.Ferr.IV.4000 (1-2), as part of the Ferraioli library, which entered the BAV through two donations, the first twenty-two volumes in 1890 and the remainder in 1926 (see D'Aiuto and Vian, *Guida ai fondi*, 1, pp. 417-19).

<sup>97</sup> ISTC if00243000 / GW 10173 / CIBN F-143.

*Boninsegni* (Firenze: per A. Mischomini, 1494).<sup>98</sup> There are two copies in the BnF, but they did not originate from the BAV. One is in the Arsenal Library, with shelfmark 4-BL-1815, and comes from the personal collection of Antoine-René d'Argenson, Marquis de Paulmy (1722-1787),<sup>99</sup> and another, Rés. P-YC-223, is in the François Mitterrand Library, but belonged to both Pietro Antonio Crevenna (1735-1792) and Hieronymus de Bosch (1740-1811) (labelled '3853', which corresponds to the auction of Pietro Antonio Crevenna's books that took place in Amsterdam in 1790).<sup>100</sup> There is no copy of it kept at the BAV.

## II. Books returned in poor condition:

1. *Francisci Petrarcae rerum vulgarium fragmenta* (Venetiis: [Gabriele Di Pietro], 1473).<sup>101</sup> According to N, a fragment was returned with nearly half of the book missing. The returned fragment is now BAV Inc. III 286, which is missing the initial quires ([pi]8 a-f10) (ff. 1-60) and features the bookplate '*Ex Bibliotheca A. G. Capponi*' on f. s ix<sup>v</sup>.<sup>102</sup> The missing initial quires of the BAV volume remained in Paris where today they are preserved as volume Rés. Yd. 60. This volume bears Capponi's stamp and, on the verso, there is an acquisition notes that reads: '*A.G.C. Aprile 1725*'. Its final

---

<sup>98</sup> ISTC iv00217000 / GW M50070 / CIBN V-154.

<sup>99</sup> See Martine Lefèvre and Danielle Muzerelle, 'La bibliothèque du marquis de Paulmy', in *Histoire des bibliothèques françaises, les bibliothèques sous l'Ancien Régime*, ed. André Vernet and Claude Lolly (Paris: Promodis, Cercle de la Librairie, 1988), pp. 300-15.

<sup>100</sup> *Catalogue des livres de la bibliothèque*, 3, p. 134.

<sup>101</sup> ISTC ip00375000 / GW M31658 / CIBN P-179. On this edition, see Ernest H. Wilkins, 'The Fifteenth-Century Editions of the Italian Poems of Petrarch', *Modern Philology*, 40 (1943), pp. 225-39, p. 228 and Marisa Gazzotti, 'Per un censimento di incunaboli e cinquecentine postillate deo '*Rerum vulgarium fragmenta*' e dei '*Triumph*': VII. Paris: Bibliothèque nationale', *Aevum*, 64 (1990), pp. 285-306, p. 301.

<sup>102</sup> The first folium, f. g i, is numbered as no. 157 in the upper right margin.

quires g - s (ff. 61-179) are from another copy, Rés. Yd. 59, which on its part contains quires g-s from Rés. Yd. 61.<sup>103</sup>

III. Books for which a substitute volume was returned:

1. *Francisci Petrarcae rerum vulgarium fragmenta. Triumphi* (Venezia: Leonardus Achates de Basilea, 1474).<sup>104</sup> According to N, another copy of the same edition was returned in very poor condition. The copy that remained at the BnF is Rés. Yd. 143, originating from the library of the Marquis Alessandro Gregorio Capponi, as evidenced by his stamp on f. b<sup>v</sup>. The returned volume may be BAV Inc. IV 215, which is the only copy in the BAV and is missing quires A8 and [chi]4, as well as ff. b4, 7, o1, and r8.<sup>105</sup>

2. *Raimundi de Vineis Legenda Sanctae Catharinae Senensis* (Firenze: apud Sanctum Jacobum de Ripoli, 1477).<sup>106</sup> This is Rés. H-919, featuring a half-erased 'Capponi' in the lower right corner of the verso of the front cover and the family stamp on f. 1. It is the *editio princeps*.<sup>107</sup> According to N, instead of this edition, a volume of the letters of the saint, edited by Aldus Manutius, was sent. It was in a terrible condition and corresponded to the work *Epistole devotissime de sancta Catharina da*

---

<sup>103</sup> See CIBN 2.3, p. 385.

<sup>104</sup> ISTC ip00377000 / GW M31676 / CIBN P-181. See Wilkins, 'The Fifteenth-Century Editions', p. 230.

<sup>105</sup> This volume bears the old signature no. 1266 in brown ink on the inside front and on the reverse of the front guard.

<sup>106</sup> ISTC iv00295800 / GW M50663 / CIBN R-21.

<sup>107</sup> For more on its significance, see Giuseppe Cencetti, 'La leggenda di s. Caterina da Siena e il suo volgarizzamento', in *Strenna dell'anno XIII dell'instituto nazionale di cultura fascista. Sezione di Piacenza*, 39 (1939), pp. 53-7 and Silvia Nocentini, 'Lo «scriptorium» di Tommaso Caffarini a Venezia', *Hagiographica*, 12 (2005), pp. 79-146, p. 92.

*Siena* (Venezia: in casa de Aldo Manutio Romano, 1500).<sup>108</sup> There are currently ten copies in the BAV, six of which can be discounted because they were added at a later date.<sup>109</sup> The provenance of three others can also be traced,<sup>110</sup> so that only the origin of Inc. II 710 remains unknown\*\*. N also suggests that there was an existing copy in the

---

<sup>108</sup> ISTC ic00281000 / GW 6222 / CIBN C-149. On this edition, see Marie-Hyacinthe Laurent, 'Alde Manuzio l'ancien, éditeur de s. Catherina de Sienne (1500)', *Traditio*, 6 (1948), pp. 357-63.

<sup>109</sup> These are Inc.Chig. II 13, Stamp.Barb. CCC IV 13, Stamp.Ross. 136 and 1988, Stamp.Ferr. II 336, and Inc. II 862. According to the BAV online catalogue, Inc. II 862 was acquired in 1856 (*sic*) in Ferrara at the auction of the volumes of the Costabili library (see the first guard leaf: '*Acquistato per f.ni 50 nella vendita della libreria Costabili di Ferrara nel 1856*', and *Catalogo della prima parte della biblioteca appartenuta al sig. march. Costabili di Ferrara composta di libri rari e preziosi in diverso genere, manoscritti, libri impressi in pergamena, quattrocentisti, Aldi, elzeviri e opuscoli* [Bologna: Marsigli e Rocchi e Gaetano Romagnoli, 1858-59], 1, p. 104 n° 836). .

<sup>110</sup> The provenance of three others can also be traced: Inc. II 589 came from the library of Cardinal de Zelada and Pope Pius VII, Inc. II 590 belonged to an unidentified Carmelite convent in Rome (f. \*1: '*Collegii generalii Carmelita[rum] Discalceto[rum] ad usum Theresia et Ioannem a Cruce in Urbe*'), and the aforementioned Inc. II 711, which came from library of the Missione Urbana di S. Carlo Borromeo in Genoa, founded in 1739 in execution of the will of the abbot Girolamo Franzoni (1653-1737) (see Luigi Grassi, 'Biblioteca della Congr. de' RR. Missionari Urbani', in Giuseppe Banchemo, ed., *Genova e le due riviere* [Genova: Pellas, 1846], pp. 497-523).

<sup>110</sup> The provenance of three others can also be traced: Inc. II 589 came from the library of Cardinal de Zelada and Pope Pius VII, Inc. II 590 belonged to an unidentified Carmelite convent in Rome (f. \*1: '*Collegii generalii Carmelita[rum] Discalceto[rum] ad usum Theresia et Ioannem a Cruce in Urbe*'), and the aforementioned Inc. II 711, which came from library of the Missione Urbana di S. Carlo Borromeo in Genoa, founded in 1739 in execution of the will of the abbot Girolamo Franzoni (1653-1737) (see Luigi Grassi, 'Biblioteca della Congr. de' RR. Missionari Urbani', in Giuseppe Banchemo, ed., *Genova e le due riviere* [Genova: Pellas, 1846], pp. 497-523).

Biblioteca Capponiana, a volume that appears in its catalogue (see *Catalogo della libreria Capponi*, p. 110), but of which there is no trace in the BAV.

3. *Dante col sito et forma dell'Inferno tratta dalla istessa descrizione del poeta* (Venezia: Aldo Manuzio e Andrea Torresani, 1515).<sup>111</sup> This is Rés. YD-802, which has 'Caponi' (sic) handwritten on the verso of the guard leaf. This copy also contains handwritten notes by Benedetto Varchi (1503-1565) and his ownership inscription on the title page.<sup>112</sup> We are told in N that the copy returned was not the one from the Capponi family library and that it had pages missing at the end. Today there are **nine\*\*** copies in the BAV.<sup>113</sup>

This means that thirteen copies were not returned, two were returned in poor condition, and eleven volumes were retained, with the same number given in exchange. According to N, the estimated value of the loss is 2,190.30 Vatican scudi. When combined with the estimated loss of 600 Vatican scudi for the unreturned

---

<sup>111</sup> USTC 808771 / CNCE 1150.

<sup>112</sup> See Maria Grazia Bianchi, 'Una nuova testimonianza degli studi danteschi di Benedetto Varchi', in *L'antiche e le moderne carte. Studi in memoria di Giuseppe Billanovich*, ed. Carla M. Monti and Antonio Manfredi (Roma-Padova: Editrice Antenore, 2007), pp. 135-59 and Anna Siekiera, 'Benedetto Varchi', in *Autografi dei letterati italiani. Il Cinquecento*, 1, pp. 337-57, especially p. 348 (no. 78). In addition to the BAV shelfmarks, it bears the ex libris 'Carroll 1850'. The following eleven incunabula come from the same library: Rés. TE17-21, Z-213, TD60-11, TD111-1 (ALPHA), TD35-7 $\alpha$ , F-588, TD128-1, TD128-1 (ALPHA), TD109-1, TD34-3, and TD73-8 (ALPHA), and nine other old editions: Rés. 4-TD29-14 (A, ALPHA), Z-75, 4-LA9-1, J-964, C-344, A-896 [1-3], 8-LN27-1519, J-474, and J-3136.

<sup>113</sup> They are Aldine A III 30 (int.1), which comes from the library of the Pontificia Università Gregoriana (Rome) and is missing its final quire (H8); Aldine A III 31, part of the Ferraioli library; Aldine III 52, which was owned by Cardinal de Zelada and is missing some of its final folia (ff. H2, 7-8); R.G.Lett. It V 3220; Stamp.De.Marinis 99 and 101, both from Tammaro de Marinis' legacy (1878–1969) (see D'Aiuto and Vian, *Guida ai fondi*, 1, pp. 412-13); and three copies from the Rossiani collection: Stamp.Ross. 6707, 6707bis, and 6707d.

manuscripts, this represents a total loss of 2,790.30 Vatican scudi.<sup>114</sup> This is a considerable sum when one considers, for example, that in 1748 Pope Benedict XIV (born Prospero Lorenzo Lambertini [1675-1758]) purchased Cardinal Pietro Ottoboni's (1667-1740) entire collection of 3,300 manuscripts for 5,500 scudi.<sup>115</sup> Moreover, it is more than a quarter of the annual fund of 10,000 Vatican scudi allocated by Pope Pius VII on 1 October 1802 for the purchase of artworks for the Museum Vaticanum.<sup>116</sup>

In addition to these losses, there are some other books that were not returned, but which the copyist of N failed to identify. These are twelve copies that appear in R, meaning that they were sent to the BnF in Paris, and remain there to this day:

1. Petrarca, *Trionfi. Canzoniere* ([Venezia]: Wendelinus de Spira, 1470)\*\*.<sup>117</sup>

This is Rés. YD-798, which bears the stamp of the Capponi family library on f. 2. At the bottom of the page, it reads '*Comprato da me A.G.C. giugno 1711.*' Two copies of this edition can be found in the BAV, but they entered the library in the 20th century.<sup>118</sup>

2. *Titi Livii Historiae romanae decades I, III-IV, cum L. Flori Epitome decadum XIV, cura G. Antonii Campani* ([Roma]: Ulrich Han, [1470]).<sup>119</sup> This is copy Rés. J-220,

---

<sup>114</sup> See N, f. 3.

<sup>115</sup> See Ceresa and Vincenti, 'Gli stampati', p. 400 n. 81.

<sup>116</sup> See Article 17 of the *Chirografo della Santità di Nostro Signore Papa Pio Settimo in data del primo Ottobre 1802. Sulle antichità, e belle arti in Roma, e nello Stato Ecclesiastico con editto dell'E.mo, e R.mo Signor Cardinale Giuseppe Doria Pamphili Pro-Camerlengo di Santa Chiesa* (Roma 1802), quoted at Lisa Cattaneo, 'L'incremento delle collezioni dei musei pontifici nel terzo decennio dell' Ottocento', in *Antico, conservazione e restauro a Roma nell' età di Leone XII, Quaderni del Consiglio Regionale delle Marche*, 22, 234 (2017), pp. 223-54, p. 224 n. 3.

<sup>117</sup> ISTC ip00371000 / GW M31675 / CIBN P-174. This is available online at <<https://gallica.bnf.fr/ark:/12148/bpt6k70418k>> (last accessed 23 December 2023). See Wilkins, 'The Fifteenth-Century Editions', pp. 226-7, and Gazzotti, 'Per un censimento', pp. 289-90.

<sup>118</sup> These are volumes Stamp.Barb. AAA.I.4 and Stamp.Ross. 2096.

<sup>119</sup> ISTC il00237000 / GW M18467 / CIBN L-178.

which bears the old BAV shelfmark '7238' on the spine and on f. 1 (see Arch. Bibl. 100, f. 60\*\*, Vat. lat. 14749, f. 97). It is also bound with the coats of arms of Pope Pius VI and Cardinal de Zelada and features both their bookplates on the verso of the front cover. There are four copies in the BAV.<sup>120</sup>

3. *Titi Calpurnii Bucolica* (Romae: Konrad Sweynheym et Arnold Pannartz, 1471), bound with a copy of *Silii Italici Punica* (Romae: Konrad Sweynheym et Arnold Pannartz, 1471).<sup>121</sup> Today this is copy Rés. G-YC-115, bearing the old BAV shelfmark '10849' (see Arch. Vat. 100, f. 60,\*\* Vat. lat. 14749, f. 355<sup>v</sup>) on the spine and on the third flyleaf. The BAV holds three copies of this edition: Inc. I 4, Inc. II 8, and Stamp.Ross. 767.

4. *P. Ovidii Nasonis opera* (Romae: Konrad Sweynheym et Arnold Pannartz, 1471) (= *Ovidii Metamorphoseon*. Romae 1471).<sup>122</sup> This is the first volume of the complete works of Ovid edited by the aforementioned Giovanni Andrea Bussi, Bishop of Aleria, and it includes the *Metamorphoses*. It is currently identified as Rés. G-YC-361 and bears the old BAV shelfmark '10896' on f. 1 (see Arch. Vat. 100, f. 59<sup>v</sup>,\*\* Vat. lat. 14749, f. 357). The other volumes of the series, Rés G-YC-361-363, have different origins. Vol. 2 (Rés G-YC-362), which has been rebound in a black morocco binding,<sup>123</sup> belonged to the Aragonese king of Naples and comes from the Bibliothèque royale at the Château de Blois.<sup>124</sup> Vol. 3 (Rés G-YC-363) is from the Biblioteca Casanatense (Rome). There are three partial copies in the BAV, but they were added at a later date.<sup>125</sup>

---

<sup>120</sup> Inc. S 5(2), Prop.Fide. II 143(2), Stamp.Barb. AAA.IV.2-4 (pt. I-II), and Stamp.Ross.286-7 (pt. II).

<sup>121</sup> ISTC is00503000 / GW M42099 / CIBN S-257.

<sup>122</sup> ISTC io00127000 / GW M28573 / CIBN O-79.

<sup>123</sup> Despite their different origins, both vols. 1 and 3 have the same binding, a 19th-century long-grain midnight blue morocco.

<sup>124</sup> On the important contribution of the kings of Naples to the BnF, see Delisle, *Le Cabinet*, pp. 217-45.

<sup>125</sup> They are copies Stamp.Chig. II 654 (I only), Stamp.Ross. 119 (II only), and Stamp.Chig. II 657 (II, imperfect).

5. *Pomponii Melae cosmographia, sive de situ orbis* (Milano: [Antonio Zarotto avec le matériel de Panfilo Castaldi], 1471).<sup>126</sup> This is Rés. G-1016, identified by the old BAV shelfmark '4495' on f. 1. It is the *editio princeps* of this work. There are two copies in the BAV (Inc. IV 738 and Stamp.Ross. 1636) and three more in the BnF (Rés. G-1016, G-1233, and GE FF-8302).

6. *Jacobi Romani congratulatio pro patria ad Nicolaum Tron* ([Venice]: Florentius de Argentina, 1472).<sup>127</sup> This is Rés. K-700, which bears the old BAV shelfmarks '5239' on the recto of the flyleaf and '2184' on f. 1. There are three copies in the BAV (Inc. IV 459[3], V 42, and Stamp.Ross. 345).

7. *Strabonis Geographiae libri XVII* (Romae: C. Sweynheym et A. Pannartz, 1473).<sup>128</sup> This is Rés. G-16, which bears the old BAV shelfmark '6661' (see Arch. Vat. 100, f. 60\*\*, Vat. Lat. 14647, f. 65) on the spine, on the third flyleaf, and on f. 1, as well as the coats of arms of Pope Pius VI and Cardinal de Zelada on the edges of the spine. There are three copies of this edition in the BAV (Inc. S 121, Stamp.Ross. 1706, and Stamp.Ferr. I 33).

8. *Georgii Trapezuntii de Partibus orationis ex Prisciano compendium* (Milano: [Filippo da Lavagna], 1474).<sup>129</sup> This is Rés. X-1577, which bears the stamp of Alessandro Gregorio Capponi on f. 1<sup>v</sup>.<sup>130</sup> A copy of this edition is held in the BAV (Inc. IV 334), but it came from the library of the monastery of the Camaldoli Hermitage in Torino.<sup>131</sup>

---

<sup>126</sup> ISTC im00447000 / GW M34861 / CIBN M 279.

<sup>127</sup> ISTC ir00317000 / GW M11010 / CIBN R-215. This is the first and only edition of this *oratio*, belonging to a genre of humanistic discourse that seldom sees publication. On this form of epideictic discourse, see Luka Špoljarić, 'Power and Subversion in the Ducal Palace: Dalmatian Patrician Humanists and Congratulatory Orations to Newly Elected Doges', in *Neo-Latin Contexts in Croatia and Tyrol: Challenges, Prospects, Case Studies*, ed. Neven Jovanović, et al. (Wien: Bohlau Verlag, 2018), pp. 81-104.

<sup>128</sup> ISTC is00795000 / GW M44087 / CIBN S-472.

<sup>129</sup> ISTC ig00156000 (the two BnF copies are omitted) / GW 10661 / CIBN G-87.

<sup>130</sup> According to the incunable catalogue (p. 805), previously it was owned by Giovanni Angelo Altemps (1586-1620), although it is absent from his 1609 catalogue (see Alfredo Serrai, *La biblioteca Altempsiana. Le raccolte librerie di Marco Sittico III e del*

9. *Poggii florentini... Facietiarum liber...* ([Nürnberg: Friedrich Creussner, ante 1479]).<sup>132</sup> This is Rés. Y2-403, which bears the old shelfmark '10641' on a barely legible scratched label on the binding spine (see Arch. Vat. 100, f. 59<sup>v</sup>,\*\* Vat. lat. 14749, f. 345)<sup>133</sup> and has 'Vaticano' written in the lower right corner on the verso of the front cover. There is a copy of this edition in the BAV (Inc. IV 225).

10. *Le Cose volgari di messer Francesco Petrarca* (Vinegia: Nelle case d'Aldo Romano, 1501).<sup>134</sup> This is Rés YD-1134, which belonged to Alessandro Gregorio Capponi, as evidenced by his ink stamp on the verso of the title page. There are six copies in the BAV: Ald. III 2; Stamp.De.Marinis. 150; Stamp.Ferr. V 5501; and Stamp.Ross. 6669, 6746, and 7279.

11. *Florilegium diversorum epigrammatum in septem libros* (Venetiis: apud Aldum Manutium, 1503).<sup>135</sup> This is Vélins 2058, with the old BAV shelfmark '10735'\*\* at the bottom of the first guard leaf and Scipione Forteguerra's handwritten annotations to the first two books.<sup>136</sup> Of the six copies of this edition sent to France,

---

*nipote Giovanni Angelo Altemps* [Roma: Bulzoni editore, 2008]). Some of his Greek manuscripts were acquired by Pope Paul V in 1612 (see Lilla, *I manoscritti*, pp. 29-30).

<sup>131</sup> See f. [a]1: 'Ex libris Sacrae Eremiti Taur[.]i'. On the Camaldolesi in Torino, see Gianfranco Armando, Laura Facchin and Diego Lanzardo, eds., *Gli Eremiti Camaldolesi di Piemonte (1601-1801)* (Cherasco: Stampatello S.r.l., 2017).

<sup>132</sup> ISTC ip00863000 / GW M34572 / CIBN P-522.

<sup>133</sup> It also bears the old shelfmarks '8293' and '2336' in the upper margin of f. 1.

<sup>134</sup> USTC 847779 / CNCE 36111.

<sup>135</sup> USTC 800004 / CNCE 1970.

<sup>136</sup> They are sparsely scattered throughout from f. Fiiii (*ad AP* 9.36.1 [Secundus]) to f. Ov (*ad AP* 11.403.4 [Lucianus]). Most of them coincide with the conjectures made by Marcus Musurus in his own handwriting in his personal copy of the Janus Lascaris edition (BAV Inc. III 81: *Anthologia veterum epigrammatum Graecorum* [Florentiae: apud typographum Laurentium Francisci de Alopa, 1494]). See, for instance, the conjectures in *AP* 9.36.1 (Secundus) (see Guillermo Galán Vioque, 'Marcus Musurus and the transmission of Greek epigrams', *MD*, 96 [2023], pp. 149-65, p. 151), 7.635.5 (Maecius), 9.189.2, and 11.313.1. As is well known, both Musurus and Forteguerra

only four were returned.<sup>137</sup> This copy remained in the BnF, while the other ended up in the Staats- und Stadtbibliothek in Augsburg, where it is kept under shelfmark LG 98.<sup>138</sup> The BnF copy corresponds to copy no. 50 of the Orsini library catalogue: ‘50. *Epigrammatario, in carta pergamena, tocco dal Carteromacho, legato alla greca in corame lionato, d’Aldo.*’<sup>139</sup>

12. *Constantini Lascaris de octo partibus orationis liber I* (Florentiae: apud B. Juntam, [1515 or 1516]) (*et alia*).<sup>140</sup> This is Rés. X-1450, which bears the family stamp

---

were active at the beginning of the 16th century in the same milieu of the ‘New Academy’ of Aldus Manutius in Venice (see Martin J. C. Lowry, ‘The New Academy of Aldus Manutius: a Renaissance Dream’, *Bulletin of the John Rylands Library*, 58 [1976], pp. 378-420, p. 386).

<sup>137</sup> See R, p. 138: ‘10753-58 [*sic*, instead of 10733-38 (see Vat. lat. 14749, f. 349<sup>v</sup>, Arch. Bib. 100, f. 59)]. *Eiusdem operis [= Anthologiae Graecae] editi Venetiis an. 1503. in oct. exemplaria sex cum notis manuscript.*’ The returned copies are Ald. III 21 (‘10736’), 22 (‘10734’), 23 (‘10733’), and 24 (‘10737’).

<sup>138</sup> The phenomenon of ending up in a different destination is by no means rare (see A. Hobson, ‘Appropriations’, p. 270). This volume is available online at <<https://www.digitale-sammlungen.de/de/view/bsb11263333?page=1>> (last accessed 21 December 2023). On the significance of this copy for the transmission of Greek epigrams, see Galán Vioque, ‘Fulvio Orsini’, pp. 271-96 and ‘Notes and Collation of a New Manuscript Witness on the *Appendix Barberino-Vaticana*’, *Prometheus*, 50 (2024) [in press].

<sup>139</sup> See de Nolhac, *La bibliothèque*, p. 354 and G. Galán Vioque, ‘Fulvio Orsini’, pp. 276-7. The first guard leaf bears the ownership mark of Fulvius Ursinus (‘Ful. Vrs.’) and the number ‘50’ in the upper right-hand corner (for more on this mark, see Ferreri, ‘*Vaticana et Angelicana*’, p. 171).

<sup>140</sup> USTC 837408 / CNCE 45496. On these grammatical treatises and other pedagogical tools with a Latin translation –the so-called *Aldine Appendix*–, first edited by Aldus Manutius and bound in numerous editions after the grammar of Constantinus Lascaris (1434-1501), see Paul Botley, *Learning Greek in Western Europe, 1396-1529. Grammar, Lexica, and Classroom Texts* (Philadelphia: American Philosophical Society, 2010), pp.

of Alessandro Gregorio Capponi on f. ai<sup>v</sup>.<sup>141</sup> There are two copies of this edition in the BAV (R.I. IV 1804 and Stamp.Ross. 4268).

There may also be a few additional copies, possibly corresponding to volumes which, according to R, were sent to the BnF. In none of these cases is there any indication that they were not returned, but they are either missing from the BAV today or the copies currently there were added at a later date. The following are therefore volumes whose provenance cannot be determined with absolute certainty. However, it is probable that they came from the BAV:

1. Francesco Cieco, *Descrizione del gran torneamento di M. Giovanni Bentivoglio di Bologna* (Bononiae: Scipio Malpiglius, ca. 1471).<sup>142</sup> This may be Rés. YD-773.<sup>143</sup> The BnF catalogue of incunabula indicates that it was acquired at the auction of Cardinal de Loménie de Brienne's collection in 1792. However, a question mark in a pencil note on the back of the first flyleaf casts some doubt upon this.<sup>144</sup> There is no copy in the BAV. There are only three known copies of this edition: one in the BnF, another in Cambridge University Library (Inc. 5.B.10.2[2062]),<sup>145</sup> and a third in the Biblioteca Nazionale Centrale in Florence (Landau Finaly inc. 75).<sup>146</sup>

---

30-1 and 74, and Paola Tomé, 'Aldus Manutius and the Learning of Greek: the *Aldine Appendix*', in *Receptions of Hellenism in Early Modern Europe*, ed. Han Lamers and Natasha Constantinidou (Leiden: Brill, 2019), pp. 31-52.

<sup>141</sup> There are also two other handwritten ex libris: 'Alba Ferrari' (f. a i<sup>v</sup>) and '*Hic liber est meus Alticotii Lazari Alticotii et amicorum simul*' (f. Bviii<sup>v</sup>).

<sup>142</sup> ISTC if00279300 / GW 10237 / CIBN F-163.

<sup>143</sup> It is now bound with *La sala de Malagigi* [Bologna: Scipio Malpiglius, ca. 1471], a unique copy (ISTC im00100170 / GW 12746).

<sup>144</sup> It is attested in the auction catalogue (see *Index librorum*, I, pp. 91-2 [no. 26]).

<sup>145</sup> This copy was presented to the Cambridge University Library on 9 November 1916 by Charles Fairfax Murray (1849-1919), an artist and connoisseur. According to the MEI database (<<https://data.cerl.org/mei/00560061>> [last accessed 23 December 2023]), it comes from Italy. This is due to an almost entirely erased inscription in the upper margin of f. a i, mentioning 'Bologna', Italy, 16th century, and an oval armorial seal on

2. *Johannis Bochacii, viri eloquentissimi, ad Fiamettam, Panphyli amatricem, libellus, materno sermone editus* ([Patavii]: ex typis Bartholomaei de Valdezoccho et Martini de Septem Arboribus, 1472).<sup>147</sup> It is possible that this is the copy with shelfmark Rés. Y<sup>2</sup>-967, although the catalogue of incunabula suggests that it was acquired at the auction of Cardinal de Loménie de Brienne's library in 1792.<sup>148</sup> There is no copy attested in the BAV.

3. *La Divina Commedia di Dante Alighieri* (Neapoli: [imprimeur du Dante], 1477).<sup>149</sup> This could be Rés. YD-101. There is a copy in the BAV but it belongs to the Rossiani collection (Stamp.Ross. 1777), which was acquired during the 20th century. There are only fourteen surviving copies of this edition.

4. *Libellus magistri Petri de Abbano de venenis - Tractatus Arnaldi de Villa nova de arte cognoscendi venena - Tractatus Valasti de Tarenta de epidemia et peste*, ([Paduae]: Matthaeus Cerdonis, 1487).<sup>150</sup> This is likely to be Rés. TF18-5. There is no copy of this edition in the BAV.

---

the same folium, which is perhaps that of Ovidio Montalbani (1601-71), professor of logic, mathematics, astronomy, and medicine at the University of Bologna.

<sup>146</sup> This copy, available online at <<https://archive.org/details/ita-bnc-in1-00000295-001/page/n135/mode/2up>> (last accessed 23 December 2023), belonged to the library of the Gori Pannilini family in Siena (bookplate on the verso of the front cover). The Landau Finaly collection, comprising more than three hundred manuscripts, eighty-two incunabula, and other printed volumes from the 16th century onwards, was deposited in the Biblioteca Nazionale di Firenze in 1949 and represents a substantial portion of the collection begun by Baron Horace Landau (1824-1903) and continued by his heirs (see Piero Scapecchi, *Catalogo degli incunaboli della Biblioteca Nazionale Centrale di Firenze* [Firenze: Nerbini, 2017], 22-1).

<sup>147</sup> ISTC ib00733000 / GW 4456 / CIBN B-533.

<sup>148</sup> A copy of this edition is mentioned in the auction catalogue (see *Index librorum*, I, 265-6 [no. 10]).

<sup>149</sup> ISTC id00025000 / GW 7961 / CIBN D-10.

<sup>150</sup> ISTC ip00442000 / GW M31877 / CIBN P-210. In *Arch. Bibl.* 53, pt A, f. 44, 100, f. 59<sup>v</sup>, and R (p. 139) it is said that this volume was published in Milan, but there is no

5. *Il Decamerone di m. Giovanni Boccaccio nuouamente corretto et con diligentia stampato* (Firenze: eredi di Filippo Giunta il vecchio, 1527).<sup>151</sup> This could be Rés. Y<sup>2</sup>-801. The copies held by the Vatican were acquired during the 20th century.<sup>152</sup>

6. Matteo Bandello, *Canti XI composti dal Bandello de le lodi de la S. Lucretia Gonzaga di Gazuolo e del vero amore, col Tempio di pudicitia e con altre cose...* (Agen: per Antonio Reboglio, 1545).<sup>153</sup> It is possible that this is the volume bearing shelfmark Rés. YD-652, the only copy preserved in the BnF. However, there is nothing to suggest that it originally came from the BAV. There is only one copy attested there, which is a later addition (Stamp.Ross. 6191). It is likely that all traces of its provenance were lost when it was bound by the French master bookbinder François Bozerian (1765-1826) at the beginning of the 19th century, a well-documented concealment method.<sup>154</sup>

---

trace of a Milan edition in 1487 (see Laura Turetta, 'Bibliografia delle opere a stampa di e su Pietro d'Abano', *Medicina nei secoli, arte e scienza* 20 [2008], pp. 659-734, p. 669). Actually, Matthaeus Cerdonis (active 1482-1487), who subscribed this book at p. 34, is a printer established at Padua, although his books rarely bears their place of edition. The error is presumably due to the fact that it was originally bound together with a copy of the same work printed in Milan in 1475 (see Vat. lat. 14749, f. 190<sup>v</sup>). Rés. TF18-5 is now foliated by hand from f. 73 to f. 107.

<sup>151</sup> USTC 814784 / CNCE 6271. On the significance of this edition in the context of the *Decameron* editions, see Isabel Rubín Vázquez de Parga, 'Primeras notas para un estudio de la «Giuntina» del 1527 del *Decameron* conservada en la Biblioteca 'Berio' de Génova', *Revista de la sociedad española de italianistas*, 4 (2009), pp. 185-210, p. 189. See also William A. Pettas, *The Giunti of Florence. A Renaissance Printing and Publishing Family* (New Castle: Oak Knoll Press, 2013), pp. 364-365.

<sup>152</sup> Stamp.Ross. 4684 and Stamp.Ferr. V 4731 (int.1).

<sup>153</sup> USTC 130011 / CNCE 4082.

<sup>154</sup> See Hobson, 'Appropriations', pp. 270-1. As is customary, it bears the gold-tooled signature of the bookbinder on the spine: 'Rel[ié] P[ar] Bozerian Jeune'. See Yves Devaux, *La reliure en France* (Paris: Pygmalion, 1981), pp. 38-9, Julien Fléty, *Dictionnaire des relieurs français ayant exercé de 1800 à nos jours* (Paris: Éd. Technorama, 1988), p. 32, and Paul Culot, *Le décor néo-classique des reliures*

Books, both ancient and modern, are a valuable commodity. As such, they have often been the target of plunder in the form of spoils of war or theft. Occasionally, however, the tables have been turned.<sup>155</sup> One example is the millions of books confiscated by the Reich Security Main Office (RSHA) in Germany during World War II, some of which have already been returned to their rightful owners.<sup>156</sup>

In 2020, two hundred and sixty-three books, including twelve incunabula, were restored to the library of the Conciliar Seminary of Cuenca (Spain). These books had been stolen and later auctioned off in the 1980s and 1990s, eventually ending up in private libraries.<sup>157</sup>

As a further BAV-related example, in 2014 Mary Parsons, widow of American antiquarian and book collector Robert David Parsons (1939-2014), agreed to deposit with the Vatican a copy of the Latin translation of the letter in which Christopher Columbus describes the voyage that led to the discovery of America, the valuable incunabulum Christopher Columbus, *Epistola de insulis nuper inventis* (Romae: Stephan Plannck, 1493), today Stamp.Ross. 674.<sup>158</sup> It had been legally acquired by her husband in New York for \$875,000. Unbeknownst to him, some crafty reader had stolen it and replaced it with a very faithful copy, which is still in the BAV, shelfmarked Stamp.Ross. 674A.<sup>159</sup> This was by no means an unimportant transfer, as a copy of this edition was

---

*françaises aux temps du Consulat, du Directoire et de l'Empire* (Bruxelles: Bibliotheca Wittrockiana, 2015), pp. 27-39.

<sup>155</sup> See some examples in Hobson, 'Appropriations', p. 257.

<sup>156</sup> See Martine Poulain, ed., *Où sont les bibliothèques spoliées par les nazis?* (Villeurbanne: Presses de l'enssib, 2019).

<sup>157</sup> See Mariano Cebrián, 'Los 263 libros antiguos robados de la biblioteca del Seminario de Cuenca vuelven a casa', *ABC* 24/08/2020.

<sup>158</sup> ISTC ic00758000 / GW 7177 / CIBN C-520.

<sup>159</sup> See 'La lettera di Cristoforo Colombo dalle Americhe', *OWL (Online Window into the Library)*, 6 (2018), 1-2 (available online at <https://www.vaticanlibrary.va/moduli/201807it.pdf> [last accessed 21 December 2023]).

recently auctioned at Christies (New York) on 19 October 2023, fetching a price of \$3,922,000.<sup>160</sup>

---

<sup>160</sup> See *Christie's Fine Printed Books and Manuscripts Including Americana. Online-Auction 22093* [19.X.2023] No. 308 <<https://onlineonly.christies.com/s/fine-printed-books-manuscripts-including-americana/epistola-de-insulis-nuper-inventis-308/195303>> (last accessed 23 December 2023).