

**Versión pre-print de un artículo publicado en *Mnemosyne* 2 (2019) 1041-1045**

On a New Witness of the Scholia on the *Planudean Anthology*

Guillermo Galán Vioque  
Universidad de Huelva  
vioque@uhu.es  
ORCID: 0000-0001-7251-8798

Abstract:

There are several copies of Lascaris's edition of the *Anthologia Planudea* with scholia around Europe. In this article a new witness that has escaped the attention of previous scholarship is identified.

Key words: *Anthologia Planudea*, scholia, Marcus Musurus

On 22 July, 1503, a young Marcus Musurus arrived at the University of Padua, where he would teach until 1509.<sup>1</sup> Among other subjects, probably in 1505-6,<sup>2</sup> he taught a course on Greek epigrams, by then known through the *Planudean Anthology*, which had been published for the first time a few years earlier by Janus Lascaris, in his *Ἀνθολογία διαφόρων ἐπιγραμμάτων* (Florentiae: per Laurentium Francisci de Alopa, 1494).<sup>3</sup>

Several copies of this edition, together with notes that ultimately come from the lessons by Musurus have already been identified around Europe.<sup>4</sup> However,

---

<sup>1</sup> On Musurus, see Geanakoplos (1962, 111–166), Cataldi Palau (2004, 295–369), Speranzi (2013), Ferreri (2014, 33–73), and Wilson (2017, 167–176). This research has been conducted during a sabbatical leave at the University of Oxford thanks to a scholarship granted by the Ministerio de Educación (PX18/00006).

<sup>2</sup> See Hutton (1935, 36–39), Sicherl (1978, 97), Pontani (2002a, 385 and 2002b, 562), and Ferreri (2014, 430–434).

<sup>3</sup> On the history of the textual tradition of this edition, see Pontani (2002b, 558, esp. n. 1).

<sup>4</sup> The copies are at Berne (MUE Inc. III 87) (Be), Cambridge (*Trinity College* Grylls 11.313) (Ca) (on these two copies, see Galán Vioque [2019b]), Città del Vaticano (Inc. III 78 [Xe], 79 [Vu], 80 [Ve], and 81 [Musurus's own copy] [Va]), Leipzig (*BU* Rep.I.56-a [with scarce notes and only up to f. Γι<sup>γ</sup>]) (Le), Napoli

hitherto nobody had detected that a copy full of these scholia exists at the Bodleian Library in Oxford.<sup>5</sup>

This volume has the signature Auct. K 4.2 and was purchased from Edward Bernard's widow for £2 in 1697.<sup>6</sup> It lacks the last quire, which is often missing,<sup>7</sup> and has copious handwritten notes in Greek. According to "Bod-Inc Online", Professor Nigel G. Wilson identified the copyist of these notes as Constantine Mesobotes, a prolific copyist who was active in Padua around 1508-1533, and thus probably attended Marcus Musurus's lectures on Greek epigrams.<sup>8</sup> Nevertheless, as he is also the copyist of the notes written on the copy at Berne, since the hand appears the same, I conclude that the notes on both volumes have been produced in a mechanical way and not as a result of his attendance at Musurus's lectures, probably in order to enhance the value of these copies by Lascaris, or because he

---

(BN S. Q. IX. C. 8) (Na), Napoli (BN S. Q. IX. C. 7 [with scholia only on ff. Ai<sup>v</sup>-Aiii; see Ferreri [2005, 97 n. 72]) (Na<sup>2</sup>), Paris (Rés. Yb 484) (Pa), Troyes (Inc. 277) (Tr), and Venezia (*Marc. gr.* IX 38) [Mr]. These scholia were partially published in *Florilegium diuersorum epigrammatum* (Frankfurt: apud Andreae Wecheli heredes, 1600) (We), and Stadtmüller (1894-1906). See Gallavotti (1981), Mioni (1985), Pontani (1982), (2002b), and Ferreri, (2005, 81-114).

<sup>5</sup> Henceforth, I will refer to this copy as Ox. There is also another volume at the Bodleian with some handwritten notes that are almost illegible in pale ink (Byw. A 2.13). This is no. 203 in Bywater (1911, 8). The notes bear no relation to Musurus's scholia. They are corrections to Lascaris's edition and quotations of texts that are related in some way to the epigrams, such as Antimach. fr. 53 (*apud* Strab. 13.1.13) *ad AP* 9.405.1-2 (f. Γviii), Nonn. *D.* 5.1-2 *ad AP* 9.198 (f. Θi<sup>v</sup>), Nonn. *D.* 17.56 *ad AP* 7.622.1 (f. Θii), Alcidas, *Ulix.* 24 (*Anth. Gr. App. Ep. sepulcr.* 148) *ad AP* 7.617 (f. Φi), *Suda* η 471, *s. u.* Ἡράκλειτος *ad AP* 7.127 (f. Φviii<sup>v</sup>), and Dion Chr. 77/78.20.1-3 *ad AP* 2.229 (f. ΔΔvi).

<sup>6</sup> See Wood (1820, IV, col. 709). Although in Coates, Palmer, Schaeper (2005, I, 185 [A 308]) it is said that this volume is "probably Wanley's list, p. 10, no. 349", information reproduced at Bod-Inc online <<http://incunables.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/record/A-308>>, this volume is not mentioned in Wanley's list (Library Records c. 1816). N<sup>o</sup> 349 at p. 10 is "Constantinus Lascares de octo partibus orationis. Gr." It is also absent from Lindsay (c. 1900). It is n. 24 in Bernard's list of books with manuscript notes (ms. London, BL Sloane 825, f. 2v).

<sup>7</sup> See Legrand (1885, I, 29-38).

<sup>8</sup> See <<http://incunables.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/record/A-308>> (viewed 10 December 2018). On this copyist, see Gamillscheg, Harlfinger, Hunger (1981, I, 124-126, no. 224; II, 123-124, no. 315; III, 138-139, no. 363). For his stay in Padua, see the colophon of *Londiniensis* BL Add. ms. 9349, f. 120 (cf. Lobel [1928, 202, esp. n. 3]).

had been commissioned to do so.<sup>9</sup> In any case, his relation with Musurus might seem rather surprising since he was normally found to be in collaboration with Zacharias Kallierges; however, in Padua around 1508 Kallierges was in close contact with Musurus, and these two copies were perhaps produced before Mesobotes joined Kallierges's circle.<sup>10</sup>

A. Pontani (2002b, 557-591) has shown that the transmission of these scholia is complex and very mixed, but in broad terms it seems that there are two families, which, for clarity, I will call  $\mu$  (Va, and his followers Ve and Vu)<sup>11</sup> and  $\lambda$  (Be, Mr,<sup>12</sup> Na, Pa, Tr, We, and Xe). This second group is usually known as *recensio lascariana*.<sup>13</sup> On most occasions, Ox agrees with  $\lambda$  and should therefore be added to this group.

This is the case, for instance, with the following scholia:<sup>14</sup> at AP 6.256.4 (Antip.) Ox and  $\lambda$  present the same note (Μιλησίου] Τοῦ Νικοφῶντος. Μιλήσιος γὰρ ἦν [f. Aii<sup>v</sup>]), while it is completely absent from  $\mu$ <sup>15</sup>; at AP 9.304.3-4 (Parmen.), Ox agrees with  $\lambda$  (έν τρισσαῖς δοράτων ἑκατοντάσιν ἔστεγεν Ἄρης / Σπάρτης] Οἱ γὰρ περὶ Λεωνίδην ὄντες έν Θερμοπύλαις τοσοῦτω πλήθει τῶν βαρβάρων ἀντεπολέμησαν [f. Av]<sup>16</sup>), while  $\mu$  presents no scholium at all;<sup>17</sup> and at AP 11.50 (Automed.) (f. Biiii<sup>v</sup>),  $\mu$  quotes Plu. *De Vit. Aer.* 829C.13-16, while Ox and  $\lambda$

---

<sup>9</sup> Stadtmüller (1894-1906, I, XI) *dubitanter* attributed the notes of the copy at Berne to Musurus himself, but this was categorically rejected by Pontani (2002b, 574 n 1).

<sup>10</sup> See Geneakoplos (1962, 210-211), Chatzopoulou (2012, 19-20), and Speranzi (2013, 22, and 270).

<sup>11</sup> On the relation among these three copies, see Pontani (2002b, 586-588). Although Ca presents very few scholia, it is closer to this branch than to the other. Actually, the scholia of Ca were probably copied from Va earlier than the versions of Ve, Vu, and even Xe, since Ca has a better text than them, where wear has rendered a passage unreadable in Va (see Galán Vioque, 2019b).

<sup>12</sup> This copy has very few scholia.

<sup>13</sup> Gallavotti (1981, 12, and 18), Pontani (2002b, 569, n 1), and Ferreri (2005, 84-94), who already used  $\lambda$  for the common source of Na and Xe\*\*. On the relation between Lascaris and this branch of the transmission, especially with Xe, see Pontani (2002b, 589-591).

<sup>14</sup> Having consulted all the extant witnesses of the scholia, what follows is the result of personal investigation.

<sup>15</sup> It is also present in Na<sup>2</sup>.

<sup>16</sup> Mr has τὸν βάρβαρον, and both Tr and We add τῷ Χέρξη at the end.

<sup>17</sup> The same occurs, for instance, with the scholia on AP 6.352.1 (Erinn.) (f. Xvii), 9.718 (Even.) (f. Xviii), 16.78.5 (f. Xvi<sup>v</sup>), 16.81 (f. Xvii), and 16.83 (f. Xvii<sup>v</sup>).

unanimously presents a different version (Πέρσαι πρῶτον ἀμάρτημα τὸ ὀφείλειν τίθενται· δεύτερον δὲ τὸ ψεύδεσθαι, ὅτι ψεύδος ἀκολουθεῖ καὶ ἔπεται τοῖς ὀφειλήμασι).<sup>18</sup>

In other scholia, the distinction between μ and λ is less so clear, and Ox always appears to be on the side of Be, and Xe. See, for instance, the following examples: at *AP* 9.323.7, there is another almost identical scholium in Be, Ox, Xe, and We (λύθρος] Τὸ ἀπὸ φόνου καὶ τὸ<sup>19</sup> ἐξ αἵματος καὶ κόνεως μόλυσμα, ἀπὸ τοῦ λύνειν τοὺς ἐναντίους τοῦ θορεῖν. ἢ τὸ ἐκ τοῦ αἵματος μόλυσμα (Hesych. λ 1363, s. u. λύθρον μαστιγόφορον) [f. Aiii<sup>v</sup>]), while it is absent from μ<sup>20</sup>; at 9.12.1 (Leonid.) (f. Aiii<sup>v</sup>), Ox agrees with Be, Vu, We, and Xe (χωλὸν] ἀπὸ τοῦ κόλου, ὃ σημαίνει τὸν μὴ τέλειον. Ὅμηρος· 'τὸ μὲν Τελαμώνιος Αἴας Πῆλ' αὐτῶς ἐν χειρὶ κόλον δόρυ' (Hom. *Il* 16.116-117), ἀντὶ τοῦ κολοβὸν καὶ μὴ τέλειον· χωλὸς οὖν ὁ μὴ τέλειος καὶ ὁ ἀτελής. λέγεται δὲ καὶ ἐπὶ χειρῶν καὶ ποδῶν τροπῇ τοῦ 'κ' καὶ 'χ', καὶ τοῦ 'ο' καὶ 'ω'), while this scholium is absent from Va<sup>21</sup>; at 9.461.5, Ox agrees again with Be, Vu, We, and Xe (μῶλον] Μῶλος ἢ πολυχρόνιος μάχη κυρίως, παρὰ τὸ μὴ λύεσθαι ταχέως [f. Av<sup>v</sup>]),<sup>22</sup> while Ca, Le, Mr, Na, Pa, Tr, Va and Ve omit said scholium;<sup>23</sup> and at 16.27 on Σαρδανάπαλος (f. Piiii<sup>v</sup>), Ox presents a long scholium, absent from Pa, Tr, and We,<sup>24</sup> which is also present with the same wording in Be, Na, and Xe,<sup>25</sup> while μ quotes here schol. *ad Arist. Au.* 1021b-c (from Σαρδανάπαλος up to τοῦτο τὸ ἐπίγραμμα) almost *uerbatim*.<sup>26</sup>

---

<sup>18</sup> This version is also present in Le, and in the manuscripts *Matritensis* gr. 4715, f. 4, and *Vaticanus* gr. 1408, f. 165<sup>v</sup>. See Galán Vioque (2019a).

<sup>19</sup> τὸ Be Ox Xe : om. We.

<sup>20</sup> Also from Ca, Le, Mr, Na, Pa, and Tr.

<sup>21</sup> Also from Ca, Le, Mr, Na, Pa, Tr and Ve.

<sup>22</sup> See *Epim. Hom.* μ 24 Dyck, *Suda* μ 1324, *EM* p. 592, 32-33 Kallierges.

<sup>23</sup> Also on f. Av<sup>v</sup>. Ox does not present the scholium to *AP* 9.461.6 (ἐξαλαπάξω), but it is present in Be, Vu, Xe, and We.

<sup>24</sup> It is also absent from Ca, and Mr.

<sup>25</sup> They present *Arist. Au.* 1021b, followed by *Ath.* 8.336F-337A and *Plu. de laude ipsius* 546A.10-11. See Galán Vioque (2019a).

<sup>26</sup> On the other hand, in the scholia on *AP* 9.357.4 (σέλινα, and πίτυς) (f. Aii), Ox agrees with Be, Na, Na<sup>2</sup>, Pa, Tr, and We, while μ, Ca, and Xe present another version (they quote Timaeus hist. fr. 118 [apud *Plu. Quaest. conu.* 676D.1-10], *Euphor.* fr. 84 Powell, and *Call. Aet.* fr. 59.6-9 Pf. [apud *Plu. Quaest. conu.*

## Bibliography

- Bywater, I. 1911. *Elenchus librorum uetustiorum apud \*\* hospitantium* [Oxford]
- Cataldi Palau, A. 2004. *La vita di Marco Musuro alla luce di documenti e manoscritti*, Italia medioevale e umanistica, 45, 295-369
- Chatzopoulou, V. 2012. *L'étude de la production manuscrite d'un copiste de la Renaissance au service de l'histoire des textes: le cas du crétois Zacharie Calliergis*, Revue d'histoire des textes 7, 1-36
- Coates, A., Palmer, N.F., Schaeper, S. 2005. *A Catalogue of Books Printed in the Fifteenth Century Now in the Bodleian* (Oxford)
- Ferreri, L. 2005. *Scoli umanistici all'Antologia planudea. Un nuovo testimone posseduto dalla Biblioteca Nazionale di Napoli e la formazione del corpus di scoli confluiti nell'edizione wecheliana (1600)*, Medioevo e rinascimento 19, 81-114
- Ferreri, L. 2014. *L'Italia degli Umanisti: Marco Musuro* (Turnhout)
- Galán Vioque, G. 2019a. *Plutarco en los escolios a la Antología Planudea*, in: F.J. Martos Montiel, R. Caballero López, eds., *Homenaje al profesor Aurelio Pérez Jiménez* (Málaga) [forthcoming]
- Galán Vioque, G. 2019b. *On Two Missing Witnesses of the Scholia on the Planudean Anthology* [forthcoming]
- Gallavotti, C. 1981. *Planudea III*, Bolletino dei Classici 2 (n. s.), 3-27
- Gamillscheg, E., Harlfinger, D., Hunger, H. 1981. *Repertorium der griechischen Kopisten 800-1600* (Wien)
- Geanakoplos, D.J. 1962. *Greek Scholars in Venice* (Cambridge [Mass.])
- Hutton, J. 1935. *The Greek Anthology in Italy to the Year 1800* (Ithaca)
- Legrand, E. 1885. *Bibliographie hellénique ou description raisonnée des ouvrages publiés par des Grecs aux XVe et XVIe siècles* (Paris)
- Lindsay, W.M. c. 1900. *A list of editions of the classics in the Bodleian with marginalia* [ms. Oxford]
- Lobel, E. 1928. *Hands and Scribes*, Classical Quartely 22, 202
- Mioni, E., 1985. *L'Antologia Greca da Massimo Planude e Marco Musuro*, in: *Scritti in onore di Carlo Diano* (Bologna) 263-307
- Pontani, A. 1982. *L'Antologia Greca fra codici e incunaboli*, Jahrbuch der Österreichischen Byzantinistik 23, 165-172
- Pontani, A. 2002a. *L'umanesimo greco a Venezia: Marco Musuro, Girolamo Aleandro e l'Antologia Greca*, in: Tiepolo, M. F., Tonetti, E. (eds.), *I greci a Venezia*, (Venezia) 381-466
- Pontani, A. 2002b. *Per l'esegesi umanistica greca dell'Antologia Planudea: i marginalia dell'edizione del 1494*, in: Fera, V., Ferraù, G., Rizzo, S. (eds.). *Talking to the Text: Marginalia from Papyri to Print. Proceedings of a Conference held at Erice, 26 September - 3 October 1998, as the 12th Course of International School for the Study of Written Records* (Messina) II, 557-613

---

677A.4-B.5]. This version is also quoted in *Matritensis* gr. 4715, f. 1<sup>v</sup> [*in margine*, from [κομί]-ζουσιν], and f. 47]. These scholia are absent from Le and Mr. See Galán Vioque (2019a).

- Sicherl, M. 1978. *Johannes Cuno. Ein Wegbereiter des Griechischen in Deutschland. Eine biographisch-kodikologische Studie* (Heidelberg)
- Speranzi, D. 2013: *Marco Musuro. Libri e scrittura* (Rome)
- Stadtmüller, H. 1894-1906. *Anthologia graeca epigrammatum Palatina cum Planudea* (Berlin) 3 vols.
- Wilson, N. G. 2017. *From Byzantium to Italy* (London) (2nd rev.)
- Wood, A. 1820. *Athenae Oxonienses: An Exact History of All the Writers and Bishops who have had their Education in the University* (London)